

DRAFT

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
Minutes
October 19, 2004
DRAFT

City Commission Chambers
2nd Floor, City Hall
241 W. South Street
Kalamazoo, MI 49007

- Members Present: Bill Snyder, Chair; Lisa Poole-Woldring, Vice Chair; Linda DeYoung; Nelson Nave; Bob Oudsema; James Tribu
- Members Excused: Rob Chamberlin
- City Staff: Sharon Ferraro, Historic Preservation Coordinator; Amy Thomas, Recording Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

Mr. Snyder called the meeting to order at 5:00 p.m.

APPROVAL OF ABSENCES

Mr. Oudsema, supported by Ms. Poole-Woldring, moved approval of the excused absence of Mr. Chamberlin. With a voice vote, the motion carried unanimously.

PUBLIC COMMENT

None

DISCLAIMER

Ms. Ferraro read the disclaimer into the record.

AGENDA (October 19, 2004)

Ms. Ferraro stated that the Ark has requested that 527/531 Eleanor be removed from the agenda in order to allow them time to negotiate agreements to have the houses moved to another location and submit a more complete application.

Mr. Oudsema, supported by Ms. Poole-Woldring, moved approval of the October 9, 2004 Historic District Commission agenda as amended. With a voice vote, the motion carried unanimously.

OLD BUSINESS

None

NEW BUSINESS

716 Minor (Case No.: IHA 04-0329)

John Rohs appeared to represent the property. The application requests that the garage be moved straight back to the northwest corner of the lot or demolished.

Ms. Ferraro stated that the garage is not original to the house. The owner wants the garage moved to allow more parking in the back yard. Mr. Oudsema commented that moving the garage would allow about six cars to park in the back yard and that he thought that would not be in the best interest of the neighborhood pointing out that most of the interior of this block is already devoted to parking. Discussion followed with regard to how the garage could be moved. Ms. Poole-Woldring inquired if the zoning ordinance would allow that many cars to be parked in the back yard. Mr. Snyder stated that, according to the zoning ordinance, no more than 50% of the back yard should be used as parking but that the subject property might be grandfathered in.

Mr. Nave, supported by Ms. Poole-Woldring, moved to allow the garage at 716 Minor to be moved to the northwest corner of the lot based on zoning setbacks. The original foundation is to be removed to grade. With a roll call vote, the motion carried by a majority vote. Mr. Oudsema voted no.

Mr. Snyder commented that any additional alterations to the garage would need to be reviewed by the Historic District Commission.

MINUTES (September 21, 2004)

There were no other applicants present so the Commissioners proceeded to a discussion regarding the minutes of the September 21 meeting. Mr. Snyder suggested that several changes be made to the minutes regarding 813/821 W. Lovell. He read the changes into the record and provided a written version for city staff.

Mr. Oudsema, supported by Mr. Nave, moved approval of the September 21, 2004 Historic District Commission minutes as amended. With a voice vote, the motion carried unanimously.

MINUTES (September 30, 2004) Special Meeting re: 527/531 Eleanor

There were no changes to the minutes.

Mr. Oudsema, supported by Mr. Nave, moved approval of the September 30, 2004 Historic District Commission special meeting minutes. With a voice vote, the motion carried unanimously.

1310 Oak (Case #IHA 04-0346)

Roger Eriksen appeared to represent the property. The application requests that the rear porch be enclosed to allow nearly barrier-free access at a later date and an upstairs laundry.

Mr. Eriksen advised that the owner of the property has health problems and she is requesting the changes to accommodate her physical disabilities. Mr. Eriksen stressed that the changes being made would be reversible so that a future occupant would be able to return the home to its original appearance.

Mr. Oudsema, supported by Ms. Poole-Woldring, moved approval of the work at 310 Oak as submitted with all work to standards, provided the owner agree to remove the addition when they vacate the property.

Mr. Nave requested that the motion be amended to state that the window of the door should not have a grill and that the 1 x 4 trim surrounding the door and framing the addition where the new porch enclosure meets the stucco of the house should also be 1x4. With a roll call vote, the motion carried unanimously.

527/531 Eleanor

While waiting for the next applicant, discussion began regarding 527/531 Eleanor. Concern was expressed regarding the 60-day time limit the Historic District Commission has to make a decision regarding this application. Mike Chojnowski, representing the Ark, submitted a request in writing that the ordinance mandated review period be extended to 120 days. This would require a decision to be made on this application at the November or the December meeting. In the event that quorum was not met for the December Historic District Commission meetings, the application would be approved by default because there might not be enough members present to either accept or deny the application. The commission felt that denying the existing application, submitted on September 3, 2004, left the Ark and the diocese free to resubmit a new plan to move the houses, with details of the move and the design of the new buildings while allowing the HDC to make a decision within the 60 day limit required by Chapter 16. After a brief discussion the following motion was made:

Mr. Oudsema, supported by Ms. Poole-Woldring, moved to deny the current application regarding 527/531 Eleanor based on the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines #1. Insufficient details on the disposition of the houses

and the design details of new construction were provided by the applicant. With a roll call vote, the motion carried unanimously.

151 E. Michigan (Case #IHA 04-0348)

No one appeared to represent the property. The application requests approval of installation of cast bronze sign plaques flanking the front entrance. Mr. Oudsema commented that the proposed oval plaques were out of character with the building. Mr. Nave suggested using the original bolt holes if a new sign was installed. He also mentioned the possibility that the new logo could go on the glass above the doors or on the doors. Ms. Poole-Woldring mentioned the possibility of putting a rectangular, brass background behind the proposed sign.

Mr. Oudsema, supported by Ms. DeYoung, moved approval of the applicant's project for 151 E. Michigan, as submitted. With a roll call vote, the motion carried by a majority vote. Ms. Poole-Woldring voted no.

826 W. Vine (Case No.: IHV 04-0022)

No one appeared to represent the property. The application requests retroactive approval of the installation of a window well and an egress window at the south end of the west side of the house (front left side) in the basement.

Mr. Oudsema, supported by Mr. Nave, moved denial of the retroactive approval of the installation of a window well and an egress window at the south end of the west side of the house (front left side) in the basement of 826 W. Vine. The owner is required to immediately remove the egress window and window well and replace the grade to its previous level with concomitant repair of the cement block and replacement of the wooden window that was removed, to standards. Based on the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines numbers 1, 2 and 9. With a roll call vote, the motion carried unanimously.

Mr. Oudsema, supported by Mr. Nave, moved that the owner of 826 W. Vine be allowed 60 days from the date of this meeting to make the required repairs regarding the window well and the egress window. With a roll call vote, the motion carried unanimously.

522 S. Westnedge (Case #IHA 04-0346)

No one appeared to represent the property. The application requests that new garage doors be built for this five bay garage.

Mr. Oudsema, supported by Ms. DeYoung, moved approval of the new garage doors for 522 S. Westnedge as proposed in the application. With a roll call vote, the motion carried unanimously.

Other Business

Discussion followed with regard to taking property owners to court when violations occur in the Historic District. Mr. Snyder commented that it is at the discretion of the Community Planning and Development Department as to how often violation letters are sent. Ms. Ferraro commented that one option would be to send a violation letter every week until the corrections are made. Mr. Oudsema remarked that the City may not have sufficient human resources available to address all of the violations that occur. Mr. Snyder suggested bringing this issue to the next Historic District Commission meeting.

Ms. Ferraro mentioned that a seminar regarding historic district design guidelines was scheduled in Ann Arbor. She requested that the commissioners let her know if they were interested in attending.

Ms. Ferraro stated that PA 169 is the Act that allows the historic district to exist. Amendments have been proposed so that the first level of the appeal process would be the City Commission and not the State Historic Preservation Review Board. Mr. Snyder suggested that Ms. Ferraro draft a letter with comments from the Historic District Commissioners to send to the Michigan Historic Preservation Network.

Ms. Ferraro commented that several satellite dishes have been removed from the historic district but that she had been finding more of them. She stated that she would call the 1-800 number of the companies that install the dishes in order to go directly to the source. This approach has been effective in the past. Ms. Ferraro commented that she had sent a letter out this year to residents of the historic district to advise them of the rules regarding satellite dishes.

ADJOURMENT

Mr. Oudsema, supported by Ms. Poole-Woldring, moved to adjourn the October 19, 2004 Historic District Commission meeting. With a voice vote, the motion carried unanimously.

The meeting adjourned at 6:50 p.m.

Submitted by: _____
(Recording Secretary)

Date: _____

Reviewed by: _____
(HPC Coordinator)

Date: _____

Approved by: _____
(HDC Chair)

Date: _____