

**HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION**  
**Minutes**  
**December 20, 2005**  
***DRAFT***

City Commission Chambers  
2<sup>nd</sup> Floor, City Hall  
241 W. South Street  
Kalamazoo, MI 49007

Members Present: Lisa Poole-Woldring, Vice Chair (Acting Chair);  
Fred Decker; Linda DeYoung; Nelson Nave; Bob Oudsema; James  
Tribu

Members Excused: Bill Snyder, Chair

City Staff: Sharon Ferraro, Historic Preservation Coordinator; Amy Thomas,  
Recording Secretary

Guests: David Anderson, City Commission Liaison to the Historic District  
Commission

**CALL TO ORDER**

Ms. Poole-Woldring called the meeting to order at 5:05 p.m.

**AGENDA (December 20, 2005)**

Ms. Ferraro advised that Steve Hassevoort from Diekema Hamann Architecture would be joining the meeting shortly to provide an update regarding the collapse of the northeast corner of the Gazelle Sports building. She requested that a discussion of the building at 214-24 W. Kalamazoo Ave. be added to the end of the agenda.

**OLD BUSINESS**

None

**NEW BUSINESS**

**527 W. South St. (Case #: IHA 05-0289)**

Sherry Larson of All Season Windows appeared on behalf of the Hospital Hospitality House. The application requests the installation of exterior storms.

Sherry Larson advised that storm windows will protect the original wood windows as well as improving energy efficiency. Most of the storm windows will be fixed sashes. Some of the windows need to be egress windows and the applicant would like to have self-storing screens. Thirty of the windows don't have storms now and the applicant is seeking approval of the first fifteen windows. Ten of the windows are to be fixed or picture windows and five are to be operational. The applicant wants to have egress windows in every bedroom. The windows are currently painted charcoal.

Mr. Nave inquired as to why the egress windows are now being requested since they are not required unless the house is remodeled. Sherry Larson stated that the egress windows are being requested due to safety issues. Discussion followed with regard to the appearance of the storm windows. The applicant advised that a circular section insert at the top of the window frame would be added to some windows to square off the opening. There is photographic evidence dating from around 1905 that this was the approach used when wooden screens were installed.

Mr. Oudsema inquired as to why this matter was not dealt with on an administrative basis since these windows have been approved throughout the historic district. Ms. Ferraro stated that this is a very important building and she wanted to have input from the HDC.

(6:12 p.m. – City Commissioner Anderson arrived at the dais.)

**Mr. Oudsema, supported by Mr. Tribu, moved approval of the installation of 30 windows as proposed for 527 W. South Street by All Seasons Windows, with mullions to be identical to what is currently on the house. With a roll call vote, the motion carried unanimously.**

**213 Elm Street (Case #: IHA 05-0287)**

Eric Lee was present to discuss the application for Steve Sattem and Jim Cavender. The application requests the installation of a custom wrought iron fence mounted on a curb.

Mr. Lee advised that each section facing the street of the fence would be identical with the side yard fences being similar but simpler in design with a more ornate gate. The inspiration for this project was a fence found in the Chicago area. Mr. Lee stated that he will reproduce the fence to fit the house at 213 Elm.

Discussion followed with regard to the type of construction to be used for the fence. Mr. Nave expressed concern that if the fence posts were buried in concrete or stone they would rust off inside and cause maintenance problems. Mr. Lee commented that using a plate with exposed bolts would probably cause more moisture to accumulate. He further commented that each of the uprights would not go into the curb. It is a self-supporting

fence and it only penetrates the concrete curb at the line posts every seven or eight feet. The curb will be poured and then cored to provide the holes for the fence to be installed.

Mr. Nave commented that there should be a joint about every 20 feet so the curb won't crack. Mr. Lee stated that he didn't have the curb engineered and that he would be pouring it himself. He said he would use the Stryker project as an example.

Ms. Poole-Woldring inquired if the curb was to be 12" with a 32" fence on top of that, and Mr. Lee responded in the affirmative.

**Mr. Oudsema, supported by Mr. Nave, moved approval of the ornate iron fence as presented for 213 Elm Street. With a roll call vote, the motion carried unanimously.**

### **214 W. Kalamazoo Mall**

Steve Hassevoort from Diekema Hamann Architecture was present to discuss the recent developments at this address. The original project approval from the Historic District Commission in October included the complete demolition of 224 South Kalamazoo Mall, the three-story building with salvage of the limestone pilasters to be reapplied to the façade of the replicated building and the demolition of all but the façade of 214 South Kalamazoo Mall also known as the DeVisser Hardware building (the two-story building next to DeVisser Alley) with a new building built behind the façade.

Mr. Hassevoort advised that at approximately 2:30 this afternoon a portion of the north wall collapsed at 214 W. Kalamazoo Ave. The roof fell into the second floor, which collapsed onto the first floor and blew out the wall by the Subs 'N' More. Only a very small portion of the east end of the wall by DeVisser Alley is still standing. The corner of 214 W. Kalamazoo Mall has been weakened because the wall came down in this manner rather than according to the plan. At present the mall is closed to vehicular traffic.

Mr. Hassevoort stated that he will be meeting with city staff tomorrow at 9:00 a.m. The contractor is shoring up the building so the street can be opened up by 10:00. Tom Nehil is overseeing the clean-up effort and Miller-Davis is salvaging the bricks that will be necessary to rebuild the corner. Mr. Hassevoort advised that the limestone pilasters from the three-story building will also be salvaged as approved by the Historic District Commission in October. Approximately half of the façade at 214 W. Kalamazoo Mall will need to be reconstructed; it is braced right now. Mr. Hassevoort stated that the intention is to recreate the corner like it was. He requested HDC input in that regard since supplemental masonry will be needed. Miller Davis is the construction manager and they have a subcontractor for the demolition.

Ms. Ferraro advised that the corner that collapsed was constructed about 20 years after the building went up so it isn't as well built as the original structure. The corner is a four-foot wide addition from the 1890's.

Discussion followed with regard to the possibility of taking the buildings down completely. Mr. Nave expressed concern that the project approved by the HDC was a façade restoration with demolition of everything behind the façade. Mr. Hassevoort advised that 214 was intended to be restored and 224 was presented with only the facing to be salvaged. Mr. Nave inquired if the 3-story building was to be taken down and the stone facing put back up and Mr. Hassevoort responded in the affirmative. He added that the wood panels between the second and third floor windows will be reproduced. Mr. Nave commented that the only façade slated for restoration is now in jeopardy.

Mr. Hassevoort stated that one more brace was discovered, but it is now in the pile of rubble. He added that the contractors went to a lot of effort to keep the façade and they are willing to rebuild, but at what point are they replicating it? Mr. Nave advised rebuilding the corner to match what was there. He stated that the interior brick should not be used to rebuild the façade because it won't hold up on the outside. Mr. Hassevoort advised that there was a pigment applied to the brick a long time ago and the intention is to restore that whole façade. Mr. Nave suggested using an oil stain that would be similar to the original pigment.

Mr. Oudsema commented that this is a historic district comprised of one building and he questioned the legality of such a district. Ms. Ferraro suggested that the HDC might want to consider allowing the façade to be rebuilt to look like the original. Mr. Oudsema mentioned that the owner could withdraw from the historic district. Ms. Ferraro advised that the process of withdrawing from or dissolving the local historic district would take about a year.

Ms. Ferraro mentioned that this is just a discussion unless Mr. Hassevoort wanted to suggest a design change. Mr. Hassevoort stated that the owner would prefer to have a new façade, and he inquired as to the time frame for proceeding with that option. Ms. Ferraro advised that the next HDC meeting is scheduled for January 17<sup>th</sup>. Mr. Hassevoort stated that it would take some time to come up with a new proposal. Mr. Nave stated that he would like the replacement to look like the original façade. Mr. Hassevoort inquired if it would be worthwhile to pursue construction of a new façade. Mr. Decker stated that he would be open to seeing plans for the new façade, and Ms. Ferraro advised that a special meeting could be convened to review the new plans. Mr. Hassevoort requested that action be taken at the December HDC meeting.

Ms. Poole-Woldring requested verification on what is being requested: The two-story building will be taken down and reconstructed the same way as the three-story building? Mr. Hassevoort responded in the affirmative. Mr. Oudsema inquired as to what assurance the HDC has that this would take place. Mr. Hassevoort stated that he has documentation of the old material. There is no building permit at this point, just a demolition permit. The drawings won't change very much but the specs will change. Ms. Ferraro suggested that Mr. Hassevoort come to the next HDC meeting with final specs. Mr. Hassevoort stated that he would like to take down the building before the next HDC meeting and return in January with the information that is required.

**Mr. Oudsema, supported by Mr. Decker, moved to allow conceptual approval of the façade changes proposed for 214W. Kalamazoo Mall, subject to the applicant appearing at the January 17, 2006 HDC meeting with drawings and specifications to validate the demolition of 214/224 S. Kalamazoo Mall. The new building would be constructed to replicate the existing.**

Ms. Ferraro requested verification that the demolition is to be included in this motion and Mr. Oudsema confirmed that it is.

**With a roll call vote, the motion carried with a majority vote.**

**Ayes: Decker, DeYoung, Poole-Woldring, Oudsema, Tribu  
Naves: Nave**

**406 Ingleside Terrace (Case #: IHA 05-0294)**

Thom Phillips was present to discuss the application. The application requests construction of a new house for Habitat for Humanity. The house is to be built north of the Habitat house completed two years ago.

Ms. Ferraro stated that the proposed house would be built on a T-shaped lot at the west end of a lot fronting Douglas Ave. The only houses on the west side of Ingleside Terrace in the historic district would be this house and the other Habitat houses, which was built approximately two years ago.

Mr. Phillips advised that the proposed house will not have a garage. It will be almost identical to the Habitat house on Pioneer, but it will be T-shaped instead of L-shaped. Mr. Tribu inquired as to the cost per square foot for constructing the new house. Mr. Phillips stated that proposed house is approximately 1,100 square feet and will cost about \$75,000 to build.

Mr. Nave commented that he added notes to the plans submitted that would be more in keeping with the historic district. He stated that the posts should be 6' x 6' and the floor should be tongue and groove 1" x 8" with 6" x 6" posts underneath. Only a dark drip edge for the roof should be used in the historic district. Ms. Ferraro advised trying to replicate the cedar shake shingles and suggested that they be brown.

Mr. Phillips mentioned that he would like to have the roof built with a steep pitch, but some of the volunteers are in their 70's and 80's and that has to be taken into consideration. Habitat for Humanity has submitted an offer on the property pending approval of the proposed plans. Smooth vinyl siding would be used for this project.

**Mr. Nave, supported by Mr. Tribu, moved approval of the project as presented.  
With a roll call vote, the motion carried unanimously.**

**Minutes (November 15, 2005)**

There were no changes to the minutes.

**Mr. Oudsema, supported by Mr. Decker, moved approval of the November 15, 2005 Historic District Commission Minutes as presented. With a voice vote, the motion carried unanimously.**

**OTHER BUSINESS**

Ms. Ferraro stated that there would be HDC training on February 21<sup>st</sup>, and she inquired as to how many of the commissioners would like to attend. Commissioners Tribu, Poole-Woldring, DeYoung, Decker and Nave expressed interest in attending the training.

Ms. Ferraro inquired if any of the HDC members had questions or changes regarding the HDC annual report to the City Commission. There were no questions or changes. Ms. Ferraro mentioned that there were 295 Certificates of Appropriateness issued for 2005 as compared to 421 Certificates of Appropriateness issued last year. She advised that the annual report should be finalized by Thursday and any comments should be submitted to her by that time.

Ms. Ferraro stated that the Old House Expo is scheduled for January 21, 2006. She advised that anyone in the historic district was eligible for a free ticket. On January 20<sup>th</sup> at 7:00 pm, Bob Yapp will be providing a free presentation with regard to restoring old houses. The Old House Expo will be open from 9 to 5 on the following day, January 21<sup>st</sup> at the Kalamazoo County Fairgrounds.

Mr. Oudsema mentioned that he owns the property on the east side of the 600 block of S. Westnedge across from his residence. The property across the street has 160 feet of frontage on S. Westnedge. Someone suggested doing a housing project on that site. The project might include demolition of the house on the corner of Dutton St. Discussion followed with regard to the possibilities for that property.

Ms. Ferraro advised that demolition of a house is a careful decision that the HDC must make. The house proposed for demolition is on the 1870's plat map. Discussion followed with regard to the possible materials of construction to be used. Ms. Poole-Woldring commented that she would like to know the history of the property.

Ms. Ferraro advised that the law firm of Willis & Willis has appealed the decision by the HDC regarding the porch of their property on Park St. Mr. Nave mentioned that there is still a sign on the gable with two lights shining on it. Discussion followed with regard to the need for appropriate recourse if a property owner ignores a decision made by the HDC. Ms. Ferraro mentioned that she could get the City Attorney's office involved with this case. The property owner could be charged up to \$5,000 and the matter can be taken to court.

Mr. Oudsema stated that he wouldn't be at the January HDC meeting.

**ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 6:35 p.m.

Submitted By: \_\_\_\_\_ Date: \_\_\_\_\_  
(Recording Secretary)

Reviewed By: \_\_\_\_\_ Date: \_\_\_\_\_  
(Historic Preservation Coordinator)

Approved By: \_\_\_\_\_ Date: \_\_\_\_\_  
(HDC Chair)