ENVIRONMENTAL CONCERNS COMMITTEE

AUGUST 21, 2019 MEETING MINUTES

MEMBERS PRESENT: Paul Manstrom, Chair; Eric Brown; Sharon Dever; Mary Clare Griffith; Ian Magnuson; Gail Walter; Kevin Weller; Aaron Wright;

EXCUSED ABSENCES: Phil Dietrich, Vice Chair; Scott Schmidt, Lauri Holmes (ECC Associate);

STAFF: Jean Talanda, Staff Liaison; Amy Thomas, Recording Secretary

OTHERS: Wayne Bond (ECC Associate Member); Bobby Glasser (ECC Associate Member);

1. ROLL CALL (Excused Absences)

- Mr. Manstrom completed roll call and determined that a quorum of members was present.

2. APPROVAL OF AGENDA:

- There were no changes to the agenda.
- **Mr. Wright, supported by Mr. Magnuson, moved approval of the August 21, 2019 ECC agenda. With a voice vote, the motion carried unanimously.**

3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES (July 17, 2019):

- The following changes were requested: Page 2, Varner should be Varker. Under Climate Action Plan, Mr. Magnuson and Mr. Manstrom are on the Targets and Tracking Subcommittee. Last page, under Vermeulen development, move the last bullet point under sustainability. Under Kalamazoo Air Quality, Mr. Manstrom did receive a response to his email from James Baker. The response came from Jim Cornell. The meeting adjourned at 5:40 p.m.
- **Mr. Weller, supported by Mr. Wright, moved approval of the May 15, 2019 ECC Minutes as amended. With a voice vote, the motion carried unanimously.**

4. ANNOUNCEMENTS:

- None

5. COMMENTS BY OTHERS ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS

- None

6. NEW BUSINESS

City of Kalamazoo Sustainability and Climate Action Plan.

Recap of ECC Role in Plan Development.

- The ECC will be vetting the Sustainability and Climate Action Plan that the City of Kalamazoo is developing. Ms. McCarthy will be providing monthly reports on the Plan.

Progress Report by Jamie McCarthy.

- Jamie McCarthy, Development Project Coordinator and Gina DeGraff, Sustainability Intern, City of Kalamazoo, Community Planning and Economic Development Department, were present to discuss the City's sustainability strategy.
- A Regional Sustainability Covenant was created in 2009. Regional partners will be included to help create the Sustainability and Climate Action Plan.
- Graduate students and faculty at WMU completed the first municipal-only greenhouse gas inventory.
- In 2015, Mayor Hopewell signed a pledge with other U.S. Mayors to uphold the commitments of the Paris Climate Agreement.
- In 2017, WMU students and faculty presented two volumes of recommendations for the Climate Action Plan. Also during that time, City staff were gathering public input for a strategic vision for the City and working on Imagine Kalamazoo 2025 and updates to the Master Plan.
- City staff, with help from an advisory committee, have been tasked with making sure that the sustainability initiatives from the Master Plan are being tracked and incorporated into every-day business.
- The Natural Features Protection (NFP) Overlay ordinance is an example of a goal from the Master Plan that was completed. The NFP Overlay was created within a six-month time frame and was established to protect natural features in the City of Kalamazoo.

- The Strategic Vision contains ten goals that were adopted in 2017. One of those goals is environmental responsibility. The Strategic Vision will serve as a guide and a framework for other plans that are created by the City.
- A map of environmental responsibilities from the Strategic Plan was presented showing six goals that came out of Imagine Kalamazoo. The goals include sustainability and conservation, water management, waste management, efficient public transportation, responsible development and healthy food access. These goals were created as the result of input from 4,000 people in the City of Kalamazoo during the development of Imagine Kalamazoo.
- These goals will be at the core of the sustainability strategy, which will include better practices and biodiversity goals that are important to community residents. Some of the goals will include plans and actions for City properties to become more sustainable with regard to reducing energy usage and reducing the waste stream. Greenhouse gas emissions from City properties are approximately five percent of the total emissions for the City. Goals will be set for the entire community.
- The ECC will play an important role in the development of the CAP over the next nine months. The CAP will be developed in three phases, similar to the process used for Imagine Kalamazoo.
- The first step is the Imagine It phase, which will focus on the process City staff will use to organize this project. It will also include community engagement. The first community meeting will take place in September.
- The second step is the Plan It Phase, which will occur from October through December. The second phase will include focused community engagement with more input from the public. This phase will also incorporate regional collaboration, with a focus on creating goals for the plan, a public survey and focus group meetings.
- The last phase will take place from January to March and will include a staff evaluation of the data that has been gathered. A draft of the plan will be created and there will be more public input through the ECC. The ECC would recommend the plan to the City Commission.
- An ad hoc advisory committee (Sustainability Team) will be meeting once a month this summer to help organize the plan. This committee will consist of City staff, City residents and experts who are interesting in sustainability and climate change. There will be approximately 20 people on the Sustainability Team; those meetings will not be open to the public.
- The Sustainability Team has five subcommittees (focus groups) to help build the plan. The sub-committees are mitigation & tracking, community resiliency, natural resources, regional collaboration, and community engagement.
- Starting in October, there will be focus group meetings to gather input from experts and people in other cities who have been through this process.
- Ms. McCarthy will provide updates at the ECC meetings and ask for feedback. The goal is to have a plan that the ECC will feel comfortable recommending to the City Commission.
- The Sustainability Team will be discussing goals and a target for the plan. The focus on a green and healthy city and shared prosperity originated with Imagine Kalamazoo. One of the themes discussed by the subcommittees was the need to be aware of how people will transition to a changing climate.
- The Plan should increase community resiliency and biodiversity. The plan will strive for a carbon-neutral future. These goals are at the heart of what the plan hopes to accomplish.
- The Sustainability Team discussed targets for green house gas reduction. They were in favor of something similar to the Paris Climate Agreement, which has become the standard for most community plans. The interim goals are varied but the main goal is to be net zero by 2050. The plan will cover the details of how that goal will be met.

<u>Committee Questions, Comments and Feedback.</u>

- Mr. Wright inquired if the goals are based on municipal greenhouse gas output or if that included everyone else in the City. Ms. McCarthy advised that the goals are for the community. The goals are based on the 2005 baseline for greenhouse gas emissions. There is a protocol to determine community-wide greenhouse gas emissions. A community-wide inventory has not been done for the City of Kalamazoo. The inventory that was done was based solely on municipal operations, such as City-owned buildings, fleet, water and waste water utilities, which includes information from throughout the county and from neighboring counties.
- In lieu of a community-wide greenhouse gas inventory, we looked at outputs in inventories from similar communities. One of the priorities is to have the community-wide inventory completed and that will involve regional cooperation.
- Ms. Walter requested clarification as to how the 2005 baseline was established. Ms. McCarthy advised that it was a scientific baseline that is referenced in the Paris Climate Agreement. The goal is to reduce carbon emission between 80 and 90 percent by the year 2050. Part of that goal it to limit the overall global temperature increase by 1.5 degrees Celsius. It is not based on anything specific to Kalamazoo.
- Mr. Wright inquired if it would be helpful to start with a new baseline of current data. Ms. McCarthy advised that the tools that will be used to make the calculations will be based on hard figures, which will be tracked over time.

- Mr. Magnuson mentioned that the baseline is important with regard to the rate of change that will be made. The goal is zero emissions by 2050. He cautioned against focusing too much on the baseline. We know what we need to and it is important to get started as soon as possible on reaching the goals.
- The rate of change is faster than expected, the ice in Greenland is melting at a rate that was not predicted to occur until 2070. The rate of change can be recalculated as the plan is being created.
- Mr. Manstrom suggested determining what the 2005 baseline might have been for the community and then do an updated inventory. If the baseline from 2005 seems reasonable, data can be tracked from that point. Otherwise, the current, updated inventory could be used as the baseline.

Comments by Others In Attendance.

- Nicky Leigh, Kalamazoo Township resident, emphasized the need for regional collaboration. It is important to include the City of Kalamazoo, the Township of Kalamazoo, the City of Portage and the entire region. She suggested creating a committee of committees to work together to understand what needs to be done. Part of the climate emergency resolution that was passed includes a directive for local, regional and state entities to work together.
- Paul Clements, City of Kalamazoo resident, stated that he is one of the authors of the Climate Action Plan that his students helped write a couple of years ago. City-wide emissions from vehicles, heat and electricity emissions are largely determined by state and national bodies, which makes the Climate Emergency Resolution particularly critical. If the goal is a reduction of greenhouse gas emissions of 25% by 2025, we need to work hard right now in 12 areas to have a chance of reaching that goal. Part of the importance of the greenhouse gas inventory, is that it tells you where the emissions are coming from and that will help with reaching the goals for reduction of those emissions.
- Shannon Abbott stated that she resides in Grand Rapids and works in Kalamazoo. She inquired if the City of Kalamazoo Climate Action Plan includes information from the 2013 Grand Rapids Plan. A study was done regarding climate resiliency and adaptation of what they are seeing with more current research, what's happening within that West Michigan community, and how that City is making plans using that data. Ms. McCarthy advised that the City of Kalamazoo staff looked at the Grand Rapids plan and others in Michigan and across the United States. The City of Kalamazoo is working with partners in Ann Arbor, including their Sustainability and Innovation Manager.
- Ken Newsome, resident of Kalamazoo Township, advised that he is spreading the word about the Sustainability Covenant, which was also signed by the Mayors of Portage and Battle Creek.
- Bobby Glasser inquired if the goal is for the ECC to have a recommendation on the plan sent to the City Commission by June of 2020. Ms. McCarthy advised that the current timeline is Spring of 2020.

City Commission Climate Emergency Declaration – Review of Request from KCCC.

Comments by KCCC and Others in Attendance.

- MaryAnn Renz, resident of Kalamazoo and member of Citizens Climate Lobby, a non-partisan, non-profit organization. She is also a member of the Kalamazoo Sustainability Team, lead by Jamie McCarthy. The Climate Action Plan needs to be developed and implemented as soon as possible but in a responsible way. Even in Kalamazoo, the impact of climate change is here now. She stated the following examples of climate change: the polar vortex, heat waves, asthma aggravated by carbon dependent energy, Lyme Disease triggered by ticks lured north by the warmer weather, and recent flooding events. When the City gives its name to this crisis, it will lay the framework for us to take the necessary actions to end our addiction to fossil fuels and provide the hope we need as we mitigate climate change and develop resilience in our community and our environment. She urged the ECC to share these concerns with the City Commission and to ask it to call the crisis what it is, an emergency. This will lead to the unified and unrelenting action that is needed.
- Joetta Carr, Kalamazoo Resident since 1977, stated that she is a member of the Extinction Rebellion Chapter of Southwest Michigan, a non-profit organization that recently received a grant from the Climate Emergency Fund. The Climate Mobilization is a national organization focused on many things, particularly cities developing climate emergency plans. The climate crisis threatens collapse of civilization. We are already seeing deadly effects of climate change at just over one degree centigrade: stronger and more frequent hurricanes, floods, fires, etc. Dangerous tipping points are just around the corner and some are happening now in the form of Antarctic and Greenland ice collapse and the thawing of the arctic permafrost. The scientific evidence points to a trajectory that is much faster than what we knew when the Paris Climate Accords were developed. We honor the Paris Climate Accords, but we must do something more quickly. We must declare a climate emergency now. Gradualist climate policies are a form of denial and must be abandoned. They are outdated and woefully inadequate. Ms. Carr suggested that the 2050 goal is outdated and something must be done sooner. We need an emergency response on all levels of government, local, state and federal. We have to look at what is necessary and make it possible before 2050. We must mobilize locally first. Strong, local coalitions across the country are pushing their cities and counties to do what is

necessary for rapid mobilization. Over 900 cities in the United States have declared a climate emergency. The government must enact legally binding policies on a local and federal level. Ms. Carr suggested downloading local draft implementation plans from the climate mobilization website. Extinction Rebellion was created three months ago and is part of the Kalamazoo Climate Crisis Coalition. She urged the ECC to encourage the City Commission to declare a climate emergency.

- Tim Tesar, Kalamazoo Township Resident, emphasized the need to reduce greenhouse gas emissions as soon as possible to lessen the long-term damage caused by these emissions. The most prudent immediate steps require us to hold global warming to 1.5 degrees Celsius reducing worldwide emissions by 45% by 2030 and to net zero by 2050. There are no signs of the necessary mobilization required to meet these targets. Even if the goals of the Paris Climate Accord are met, the global average temperature would increase reach 3 degrees Celsius. Historically, regarding total emissions between 1850 and 2007, the U.S. accounts for 28.8 percent of emissions versus only 9 percent from China. On a per person basis, the U.S. accounts for 17.3 tons per person annually versus 5.4 tons per person in China. For the world as a whole, the average is 4.5 tons per person. A declaration on the part of the political leaders would be one step that would help build public consciousness of the situation.
- Dasha Nisula, City of Kalamazoo resident and member of the Kalamazoo Climate Crisis Coalition, led by Professor Denise Keele, stated that, over the past 30 years, she has witnessed a decline in two of the most important environmental issues: water and air. She recalled a colleague taking a jug of water on a trip to Chicago. Back then, Michigan water may have been better than water in Chicago but they know otherwise now. Air pollution affects our mental and physical health and brings negative effects on children and seniors. It is known that we are poor in preservation and prevention. However, we are known to be superb responders to a crisis of any sort. Dr. Nisla emphasized the need to declare a climate crisis and mobilize everyone to take part before a response to the climate emergency may be too late.
- Cybelle Shattuck, Hope for Creation, a grassroots coalition of people in the Kalamazoo County region who strive to address climate change in our lives. The earth and its natural systems are gifts to be tended and protected. Humans are part of the interconnected system of plants and animals, insects and micro-organisms. The whole world suffers when human actions disturb the natural balance. Climate destabilization is evidence of a system out of balance. Climate change exacerbates social injustices such as poverty and lack of access to affordable food, water and housing. It increases human suffering due to increased conflicts and displacement of refugees. We ask our local government to help build a more just and sustainable society by declaring a climate emergency that sets the stage for immediate climate action in Kalamazoo. The climate action should include reduction of greenhouse gas emissions and adaptation planning to build community resilience in ways that ensure all members of our community, especially those who are vulnerable, will be prepared for the upcoming climate chaos. It is hoped that the climate emergency declaration will be a step in promoting this to the wider community in raising awareness.
- Gail Nelson, resident of Kalamazoo Township, stated that she became aware of climate change in the early 1990's due to two things: a copy of the Atlas of World (copyright 1990) and some interesting things written by the editors of that volume regarding climate change. Also, the guiding principle of a local company she worked for that pioneered in nontoxic, non-solvent adhesives with sealants. There is a section in the 1990 Atlas called habitable earth stating that flora and fauna are vital to us. By capturing energy and removing toxic waste and replenishing oxygen, they maintain the delicate balance required for human life. However, the human species has precipitated the sixth great biological decline. Furthermore, climate warming by the greenhouse effect could eliminate entire ecosystems as temperature zones migrate pole-ward. Humanity is floundering the capital decrease by billions of years of evolution at a rate that is breathtakingly swift by geologic standards. We are depleting minerals in the ground, nutrients in the soil, ozone in the stratosphere. We are drawing down an irreplaceable reserve of genetic diversity. Yet there is some reason for optimism, much of the technology has been invented for cleaning air and water, shifting to alternative energy sources, and linking conservation and development, urgently needed now. A major new commitment to the environment and to control of human population growth so that our descendants can continue to exist in a beautiful, biologically fit world. Please join in the effort to accomplish mankind's most important undertaking in all of history.
- Denise Keele, Kalamazoo Township resident, stated that the emergency declaration is from the Kalamazoo Climate Crisis Coalition, which includes about 25 organizations. Approximately 60 people show up at the Coalition meetings. There are about 500 people on the mailing list. The coalition is larger than the specific groups that signed the letter that was submitted. The Coalition will be holding a global strike event on September 20th. The purpose of declaring a climate emergency is so that the people who know what's happening are acting like what's happening, which is necessary to raise the public consciousness and will that is needed to make positive changes.
- Ron Kramer, City of Kalamazoo resident and founding member of the WMU working group on climate change and a member of the coalition. He has spent the last ten years researching and writing about climate change and he organized a course on climate change in society in the Department of Sociology. We know about the science and the

ecological effect but there are also broad social effects resulting from climate change. If the City Commission passes a climate resolution, that will have two effects, one that is local and one that has a broader, more political effect. It would support and encourage the development of the sustainability plan. It would also help create political pressure at the federal level and with the international political community. Having a thousand or more communities around the country saying this is an emergency helps bolster broader political pressure. It is important to deal with the climate crisis now for the benefit of future generations.

- Beth Bradburn, City of Kalamazoo resident, member of Extinction Rebellion and the Kalamazoo Climate Crisis Coalition and Associate Professor of English at Western Michigan University. Declaring a climate emergency is not just a frivolous exercise in words. No one knows better than an English professor just how meaningless words can be. Emergency isn't just a word, it is a story with great meaning. Stories shape how we relate to other people, to the world around us and to ourselves. Stories shape how we understand the past and how we imagine the future and they shape how we put our beliefs and values into action. Emergency is the kind of story that tells us what to do: attend carefully to a possibly complex situation, prioritize those who are in the most danger, put aside small conflicts in the service of a greater good. Individuals facing emergencies in the moment are called to do these things automatically. A city like Kalamazoo can lay the framework for these actions by formally declaring a climate emergency. Emergency is a scary word but it does not mean panic, it means pay attention and then deliberately put your resources toward saving life and health. That is the story we are asking the City to be a part of.
- Tom Small, resident of the City of Kalamazoo, is a member of the Sustainability Team that is working on the Climate Action Plan and a member of WMU's Climate Change Working Group. Mr. Small was present to discuss the importance of invertebrates. He is concerned that they might be overlooked and they are disappearing. We all depend upon them as the basis of our system of life. Most of the studies that have been done in the last 40 years suggest that as much as 76% of insect biomass has disappeared from the planet in the last 30 to 40 years. That is an emergency in the spirit and soul of the earth as a life system. Fifty percent of the local population of animals has been lost since 1980. A rise of two degrees centigrade in the world's temperature means probable extinction for about 40 to 45% of the plants. The loss of insect populations is an emergency. Climate change is not the only thing responsible for that loss. Attention to a climate emergency leads inevitably to dealing with all the systems of life support for our species and for the whole of creation on earth.
- Nicolette Leigh, resident of Kalamazoo Township and Kalamazoo Township Trustee, stated that the Township passed a climate emergency resolution in June. The Township is just a small part of Kalamazoo County. The City of Kalamazoo is the largest, most influential governmental entity within Kalamazoo County. What the City does, people hear about. Declaring a climate emergency is essential just to bring everybody else on board. Once the emergency resolution is passed, we also need to form a coalition of all the local governments. We need the City to lead the County.
- Brian Rhinesmith, resident of Kalamazoo Township and member of Citizens Climate Lobby and Extinction Rebellion, stated that there is little time left to affect the massive changes needed to stabilize the climate. We can make an impact to lower our carbon emissions by instituting policies related to energy conservation and renewable energy. Grand Rapids has a good model for what they are doing. Our children and grandchildren deserve a habitable world. Without a commitment to the climate emergency, a million species may go extinct and severe weather events may increase, including flooding and drought in Michigan. Cities and countries around the world are focusing on climate emergency and have passed and are ready to pass legislation to stem the greenhouse gasses. It is now time for Kalamazoo to step up as a progressive City and declare a climate emergency. The goal for Kalamazoo should be to transition to 100% renewable energy as quickly as possible. This is also the morally right thing to do as climate injustice disproportionately affects poor people and people who often live in heavily polluted areas.

Committee Comments and Discussion.

- Mr. Bond inquired if anyone knew what other cities and towns in Michigan have officially declared. Someone advised that Grand Rapids, Traverse City and Kalamazoo Township have declared climate emergencies. Dr. Keele stated that three or four governmental units in Michigan have declared a state of emergency. There are eight or ten cities in the State of Michigan that are on the hundred percent renewable goal in Michigan. More than nine hundred cities worldwide have started a climate emergency declaration process.
- Ms. Walter inquired what the next step would be if the City of Kalamazoo declared a climate emergency and who makes that decision. Dr. Keele stated that the hope would be for the ECC to make a recommendation to the City Commission to pass a resolution and the City Commission would be the official body to vote on and pass a climate emergency resolution. The Coalition is happy to help with that and there are templates available as examples of what the resolution could state.

- Ms. Walter inquired as to what would happen after a resolution is passed and a state of emergency is declared. Dr. Keele advised of the need to continue to mobilize and catalyze this movement. We need to use the proper language to explain the science to people who don't know. Those people are looking to the people who do know to use the language that puts it in the right perspective for them and that is the big goal of defining the climate emergency.
- The next step after the City Commission signs the climate emergency resolution would be to do a Climate Action Plan but the City is already doing that.
- Ms. Renz mentioned that when the Climate Action Plan is rolled out, there are interconnections with businesses that need to be made. The declaration of a climate emergency is a starting point that the City can rely on; it has a good basis for further action.
- Someone mentioned a book by a famous psychiatrist named Robert J. Lipton called The Climate Swerve. He talks about detecting this shift or swerve about building awareness. Paris was one example of the climate swerve. The building of political will contributes to the climate swerve. If we join with other communities, we are helping to move that swerve forward.
- Mr. Bower inquired of the Township Supervisor if there were reasons why the Township might have considered not signing the declaration of climate emergency. Ms. Leigh stated that no one spoke against the declaration of climate emergency. They previously declared a Climate Change Resolution and now they are emphasizing that it is an emergency not just climate change and that it is not just local. Part of the resolution stated that work would be done locally, regionally, state-wide and nationally to join the coalition. People have been thinking more about the environment. The City has more problems that are going to get worse as the climate worsens, such as homelessness and epidemic illnesses. Once the emergency is declared, one of the next steps is the Climate Action Plan. Another step is looking at mitigation. There will be migrations into Michigan because there might be fewer issues with flooding or droughts. There is a lot for governmental people to start thinking about.
- Someone stated that, for people who are working in outreach, this will be a tool they can use to help emphasize the importance of joining the efforts the City is making.
- Someone mentioned that Hoboken, New Jersey declared a climate emergency and then they conducted a green house gas emissions inventory, which is what Jamie is talking about. It would be helpful to have a new baseline to determine what our footprint is in the Kalamazoo area. What is our emissions inventory right now? The second thing they did in Hoboken was to work with local organizers to create a plan to achieve carbon neutrality by 2027. There are hundreds of people to help the City of Kalamazoo develop and implement a plan that will get us to carbon neutrality by the late 2020's.
- Mr. Magnuson inquired of the 900-plus cities that have declared a climate emergency, is anybody aware of any examples where they have attached a policy requirement to it?
- There are different ways the resolution can be put together based on what the community needs. The Michigan League of Conservation Voters does a lot of policy work on the State level and the local level. There is an option to put something in the resolution with regard to what makes sense for the region. We can also view that footprint with our state and federal leaders to try and implement other policies as well. When local communities implement plans, then state and federal leaders start looking at it too.
- Someone mentioned the town of Bellingham Washington, which is similar in size to Kalamazoo. They set definite goals and reached those goals earlier than they thought they would. They later revised the numbers to make them stricter.
- Dr. Keele advised that Kalamazoo is not to the point of being able to attach a policy to the climate declaration. The resolution needs to be done first.
- Someone commented that there are many people who already know what to do. We don't need to reinvent the wheel; we need to draw on knowledge that is already out there.

<u>Consideration of ECC Support and Next Steps.</u>

- Discussion followed with regard to who would write the resolution. It was suggested that the ECC could submit a resolution to the City Attorney's office for review/approval. Comments were made about the importance of the newer information that is available and the importance of achieving goals sooner than 2050.
- Dr. Keele suggested that the Kalamazoo Climate Change Coalition could work with the ECC to write a Climate Emergency Resolution. The resolution would contain general information; the Climate Action Plan would contain more specific information.
- It was decided that the KCCC could write a draft resolution within two weeks. That draft would be reviewed by the ECC with suggestions for modification going back to the KCCC. The resulting draft would then be considered for a recommendation by the ECC at the September ECC meeting. If the ECC votes to recommend adoption of the resolution by the City Commission the resolution document will be turned over to City staff for the purpose of getting

it on the City Commission agenda ASAP. That timing means that the resolution would not be on a City Commission meeting agenda prior to the KCCC sponsored climate strike scheduled for September 20th.

- **Mr. Wright, supported by Ms. Dever, moved to have the ECC collaborate with local partners to write a draft Climate Emergency Resolution, within the next two weeks, to be submitted to the City Commission. With a roll call vote, the motion carried unanimously.**
- This concluded the public input portion of the meeting in the City Commission Chambers. The ECC members returned to the Community Room to discuss the remainder of the agenda.
- Mr. Magnuson mentioned that one of the data sets looked at cities comparable in size to Kalamazoo. Data for Kalamazoo was similar to other cities of similar size. That might be another reason for Kalamazoo to differentiate itself. He would prefer for Kalamazoo to be at zero rather than net zero by 2050. Mr. Manstrom commented that everyone cannot be net zero by 2050 because there would be no offsets.
- Ms. Griffith mentioned that the only hard numbers in the sustainability strategy are for greenhouse gas emissions. A lot of things must be done to reach those goals, where are those numbers? Ms. McCarthy advised that those actions would be included in the sustainability strategy. We are on step one of ten steps in developing a full plan. It might be more appropriate to refer to them as themes rather than goals.
- Mr. Glasser mentioned there are goals for city buildings, industry and residents. He commented that a lot of people have natural gas fueled furnaces. Will there be a resolution stating that home owners will need to have a non-emission furnace? There are questions as to how the plan can actually be implemented. It is possible that the best furnace available now will be obsolete in the near future.
- Mr. Manstrom mentioned that the Sustainability Plan will set a lot of goals. Funding those goals will become part of the budget process. There will not be a pot of money up front. Ms. McCarthy stated that the City Commission and/or the City Manager's office would make funding decisions based on a request. That can be built into a capital improvement plan. She did request money to start looking at home efficiency and home energy audits through the Foundation for Excellence. There should be opportunities to tap into that fund which is a little different than the regular budget.
- Mr. Magnuson mentioned that Michigan cities have a requirement to balance their budgets. They can't debt finance anything unless there is a millage. The bond market is not good now so the City could borrow money for next to nothing if they want to be aggressive with this plan. Ms. McCarthy suggested asking the City Attorney that question. The City finances things on a regular basis but that might be utility based.
- Mr. Wright inquired if the Chamber of Commerce would be involved as a community partner to involve local industry. Ms. McCarthy advised that Kalamazoo no longer has a Chamber of Commerce but Southwest Michigan First might help fill that role or Downtown Kalamazoo Partnership and there are other economic groups that might be able to help.
- Mr. Weller stated that he works at Pfizer as a union pipefitter and he knows that for a number of years their plant was run on coal-burning boilers. They are replacing them all with natural gas burning boilers. You can see the mountain of coal is being slowly reduced. Ms. McCarthy mentioned that a lot of corporations follow the sustainable development ISO and they have some of their own organizing and motivation. Money is always a motivational factor.

7. UNFINISHED BUSINESS/UPDATED DISCUSSION

Allied Paper Site Cleanup.

- Ms. McCarthy mentioned that testing has been done for PFAS at the Allied Paper site. The environmental trust that manages that site is eager to start on their remedial design. That phase might start by the end of this year and possibly finish within nine months time. The City has been active in making sure there are contracts with consultants who can verify the information they get. She heard that the EPA and the Environmental Trust will be having a meeting in the near future.
- Mr. Wright mentioned a meeting at St. Joseph's Church in July. Ms. McCarthy attended that meeting, which was held by a community advisory group sponsored by the EPA. They will meet mostly in Otsego to discuss community issues related to the Superfund sites. That is the public engagement branch of the EPA, not their technical project managers.
- It is possible that the remediation project (ground breaking) might start in 2020 at the Allied Paper Site. It was unclear as to whether or not this project would be bid out. The EPA is working with Tetra Tech regarding remediation of the site.

BTR2/Asylum Lake Silt and Sediment Release.

- Details of the testing by Kieser & Associates were presented at the Asylum Lake Policy and Management Council meeting. The Council was concerned about possible long-term damage to Asylum Lake from the run-off at the BTR2

site during the rain even in June. Testing by Kieser & Associates showed no signs of Arsenic in the run-off that left the BTR2 site. They are not recommending any further testing or remediation.

Vermeulen Property Rezoning.

- A rezoning request had not been submitted but the owner and his engineers met with City staff for a project meeting. Design standards were discussed as they relate to the NFP Overlay that was recently approved. City staff recommended to the developer that he request a rezoning for the property before further review could take place.
- The WMU Foundation looked into purchasing the Vermeulen Property, which is adjacent to the Asylum Lake Preserve owned by WMU, but they did not have the funding to proceed with the purchase.
- A Drive and Shine car wash is being constructed on W. Main (former Davenport College site). It is not a typical car wash and there has been concern about the developer creating a similar development on the former Vermuelen property.
- Ms. McCarthy advised that the downtown streets (Michigan and Kalamazoo Ave.) design meeting is tonight at the Kalamazoo Institute of Arts from 6 p.m. to 8 p.m. This is the first of a series of three or four meetings that will take place over the next year.

8. SUB-COMMITTEE REPORTS:

NFP Overlay Review Board.

- Mr. Glasser stated that the NFP Board meets twice per month. The meetings are open to the public. The board has been discussing mock cases so far; there have been no real cases to discuss. The next meeting has been cancelled. They are talking about Phase 2, which would include amendments to the NFP Overlay district. At this point, the overlay district is primarily properties along water bodies. The board is looking at including other areas of undeveloped land in the overlay.
- Mr. Magnuson suggested that it would be helpful for a member of the NFP Board to also be on the Sustainability Team. Tom Small is on the Sustainability Team but he is not on the NFP Review Board.
- Mr. Glasser noted that the City website does not have information about the NFP Board. Also, the ECC member information is not current. He suggested approaching someone at the City to update that information.

Air and Water Quality.

- Mr. Glasser advised that the Air and Water Quality subcommittee had their first meeting at Bell's Brewery. He forwarded draft notes from the meeting to Mr. Manstrom. The notes are on the Google Drive in a folder named "Air and Water Quality." It was suggested that all of the subcommittee meetings should be documented in a similar fashion.
- Mr. Wright stated that meetings between Graphic Packaging and the City of Kalamazoo are continuing. Graphic Packaging shared the minutes from their last meeting. The City is talking about putting in a system to monitor odors. Mr. Manstrom stated that the City has retained Jones and Henry Engineering Consultants to assist with looking into the odor issues.
- Mr. Wright spoke with Monica Brothers, local EGLE air quality official. EGLE met with representatives from Graphic Packaging. EGLE is seeking a binding commitment from Graphic Packaging to do something about the odor. Graphic Packaging has pledged to do an odor study. Someone from EGLE's State enforcement team also attended the meetings.
- Jim Cornell, from the City of Kalamazoo, invited ECC members to attend the meeting. Mr. Wright and Ms. Brothers expressed an interest in attending those meetings.

Wildlife and Natural Resources Protection

- Mr. Bond advised that the DNR had interesting action plans, which relied on hunting. They acknowledged that hunting has decreased as far as deer management. There is a non-profit organization in Connecticut that Ann Arbor used to understand their potential culling situation. There are a couple of places out east and one out west that did use their services.
- Ms. Walter found a number of links. There is an on-line class developed by Cornell University on how to evaluate and develop a plan to assess deer issues in your community.
- The bird tape has been installed on the glass on both sides of the walkway between Haenicke Hall and Wood Hall.

Waste Management/Litter

- Mr. Brown provided quotes for obtaining more cigarette butt receptacles in areas where the City could put them; Ms. Dever will provide that information to the ECC. Action items from the subcommittees should be brought back to the ECC for a vote.
- Ms. Dever advised that that the Parks and Recreation Department does a few clean-ups per year. She will follow up to get more details.

- Mr. Weller contacted City staff regarding the View from the Curb publication that the City sends out quarterly. He requested that information about litter prevention be added to that publication. Mr. Weller would like to contact businesses, schools, the transportation department, etc. and ask them to support the Clean-up Kalamazoo campaign that he would like to start regarding litter prevention.
- Mr. Manstrom stated that the role of the ECC is to advise City staff and the City Commission regarding environmental concerns and to make recommendations. Individual ECC members can participate in litter prevention, clean-up efforts, etc. and support the organizations behind those efforts but they should do this as individual citizens and not officially represent the ECC in what could be termed activist roles.
- Ms. Dever reported that Mr. Schmidt has been looking into the amount of property taxes that are used for our recycling system. He forwarded the recycling contract to Ms. Dever and she will post that on the Google Drive.

Planning Commission

- No report

Tree Committee

- No report

Asylum Lake Policy & Management Council –

- Refer to information previously provided.

Parks & Recreation Advisory Board

- No report

Wellhead Protection Program Committee

- No report

9. ADJOURNMENT:

- The meeting adjourned at 7:15 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Amy Thomas

Recording Secretary