

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
Minutes
November 17, 2009

Mayors' Riverfront Park, Conference Rm.
251 Mills Street, Kalamazoo, MI 49007

Members Present: Jay Bonsignore, Chair; Bob Cinabro; Linda DeYoung; Nelson Nave; Erin Seaverson; James Tribu

Members Excused: Bob Oudsema

City Staff: Sharon Ferraro, Historic Preservation Coordinator; Amy Thomas, Recording Secretary

Guests: Pat McCarthy; Richard Emig; Members of the Holland Historic District Commission

I. CALL TO ORDER

Mr. Bonsignore called the meeting to order at 5:00 p.m.

II. APPROVAL OF ABSENCES

Mr. Oudsema informed city staff that he would not be present for the November HDC meeting.

Mr. Cinabro, supported by Mr. Tribu, moved approval of Mr. Oudsema's absence from the November 19, 2009 HDC meeting. With a voice vote, the motion carried unanimously.

III. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Ms. Ferraro requested the addition of a discussion under item C (other business) regarding the possibility of scheduling a training session for the HDC members in late winter or early spring.

Ms. DeYoung, supported by Mr. Nave, moved approval of the November 17, 2009 HDC agenda as amended. With a voice vote, the motion carried unanimously.

IV. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS

Welcome to visitors from Holland, Michigan Historic District Commission.

V. DISCLAIMER

Ms. Ferraro read the disclaimer into the record.

VI. OLD BUSINESS

A. 425 Oak (Case #: IHA 09-0438)

Jason Farmer, architect, and Govinder Singh, owner, were present to discuss the application.

Mr. Farmer advised that the HDC was provided with the revised drawings after the meeting last month. The design of the roof over the front porch has been revised. Mr. Farmer is proposing a 4/12 metal shed roof over the front porch. The applicants had proposed to locate the HVAC on the roof, but they have now chosen an alternate location on the north side of the building at ground level towards the rear in the least visible spot on the property where they will be screened with a fence.

Mr. Nave inquired about the location of the 10 x 10 dumpster area. Mr. Farmer stated that the dumpster used to sit in front of the building. It was a highly visible area with no screening. It will be moved to the south end of the building and screened.

Mr. Nave inquired as to how the canopy in front would be built. Mr. Farmer advised that the canopy would have a post frame construction with concrete tubes for footings. The ramp and the railing will be wood with wood headers and a metal roof. The ramp and steps will be under the front roof. The entire surface around the building will be paved except the north side, where there is a small amount of grass adjacent to the neighbor's gravel drive.

Gutters may be installed across the north and south eaves to prevent run-off on the condensers. Mr. Nave requested that half round, aluminum K-style gutters be installed. The ends could be left open; the gutters should extend over the mechanical equipment.

Ms. Seaverson inquired as to how tall the mechanical equipment is versus the height of the fence. Mr. Farmer advised that residential sized units are being installed. The largest residential unit available is a five-ton air conditioning condenser. It will be approximately 3' to 3 ½' tall and about 3' square, but that can vary slightly depending on the make and model. The other condensing cooler over the walk-in cooler would typically be a little shorter and longer. The 5' tall screening will completely conceal the mechanical units. There will be no gates on the screening, it will be screwed on and can be removed for servicing the mechanical equipment.

Mr. Bonsignore inquired how far the mechanical units would be from the house to north. Mr. Farmer estimated that the distance would be 20 to 24 feet. The five foot tall screening will direct the noise upward. The high efficiency units should be as quiet as standard residential units.

Mr. Nave inquired if there was a zoning requirement for fencing between the residential and commercial parking on the north and south sides of the property. Mr. Farmer stated that there is a solid wood, stockade fence behind the house. There is nothing by the east side of the dumpster. Having a fence there would block the asphalt drive for the neighbor. Mr. Nave inquired if there is a fence behind the house to the south; Mr. Farmer responded in the affirmative.

Mr. Farmer advised that he is proposing to install 6 x 6 Cedar posts to support the front roof. Turned columns would not be in keeping with the era of the building. The posts could be wrapped if the HDC prefers that they not be exposed. Ms. Ferraro advised that rough sawn lumber should not be used. The columns should be painted. Ms. Ferraro expressed concern that the columns might not hold up in a relatively high impact setting. She suggested using turned Cedar posts, which could be obtained for a reasonable cost. The applicants could be given the choice between solid Cedar and a simple turned post.

Mr. Bonsignore stated that he would like more detail, not just a square or rectangular post. He suggested chamfered corners with a cap detail. Mr. Farmer advised that he is proposing to put a couple of molding pieces where the post meets the header. It would be a simple detail to tie in with the rest of the building. Mr. Nave suggested that a 6 x 6 turned post would be appropriate. Ms. Ferraro cautioned against adding conjectural features such as brackets, which might jeopardize the tax credit.

Mr. Nave, supported by Mr. Cinabro, moved approval of the application for 825 Oak Street. The siding on the vertical surface (west/front) if patched, should match the existing siding under the existing vinyl siding. The trim on the edge and at the top should either match the existing siding or it should be wood trim. The material below the glass should be plywood with framed panels. The wood soffits, rafter tails and fascia on the rear should remain or be repaired. The posts in front should be 6 x 6 turned posts with treated bases. The rails and deck should be constructed to historic district standards. Half-round gutters should be used if new ones are to be installed. A dark drip edge should be used on the roof. With a roll call vote, the motion carried unanimously.

Ms. Seaverson mentioned that the application states that the exterior of the building would be power washed and cleaned. Mr. Farmer advised that if there was any damage to the siding, it would be repaired. The building currently has vinyl siding on the north side of the building, the rear/east gable, and on the parapet. The siding on the west will be torn off and replaced with smooth wood siding. Ms. Ferraro mentioned that the original siding may still be underneath the vinyl siding. Ms. Seaverson was concerned that if the existing siding was wood, it might be damaged if it were power washed. Mr. Farmer advised that there is no exposed wood siding at this point.

Public Comment

Richard Emig stated that he owns property around the corner from the applicant's property. He is hoping that the applicant's business will be well run and not a problem like it has been in the past. Also, the signage should be appropriate; that issue has not yet been discussed. Ms. Ferraro advised that the sign that has been there since the 1950's will be remounted, and a goose neck lamp will be installed to illuminate the sign.

VII. NEW BUSINESS

B. 814 W. South (Case #: IHA 09-0464)

Kevin Osborne was present to represent the property. The application requests the construction of a two-bay, hipped roof garage directly behind the house. The garage doors will open to the east.

Mr. Osborne advised that he attended the October HDC meeting and he is returning with a more detailed plan. Mr. Osborne is trying to create a historically accurate garage at this address. The picture provided shows a rough idea of what the garage will look like. It will have a hip roof and frieze board. Mr. Osborne requested ideas for the soffit material and the roofing. He suggested that the roof have a 12" overhang. He would like to use fiber cement siding, the reveal will depend on what the HDC feels is appropriate. The siding on the house has a 3 1/4" reveal. Last month some concern was expressed that the garage should not match the house.

Mr. Bonsignore advised that the smallest fiber cement siding is 5 1/4", which would have a 4" reveal if it is installed in the standard fashion. Ms. Ferraro advised that the new garage should not match the 1860's house. The original garage, now missing, was likely built in the 1920's. Mr. Osborne mentioned that the fiber cement siding is available in a Dutch Lap style, but he was not sure if it was smooth siding. Ms. Ferraro stated that a 12" to 16" overhang and a hip roof would be appropriate to echo the details of the house.

Ms. Ferraro advised that the biggest question is where the garage should be placed on the property. The applicants would like to have the garage behind the property rather than at the end of the driveway, where the original garage was located. Either location would be acceptable in the historic district. Ms. Ferraro inquired as to the HDC's preference. Mr. Osborne advised that the ZBA expressed a preference for having the garage located in the back yard. Mr. Nave commented that locating the garage behind the house would provide more parking space for other cars.

Ms. Seaverson mentioned that the slab is still there from the previous garage. Mr. Tribu inquired if there was room for a turn around if the garage were built behind the house. Mr. Osborne responded in the affirmative, and stated that the garage would be used more

for storage than for parking vehicles. Mr. Tribu and Mr. Cinabro were in favor of locating the garage behind the house.

Mr. Nave, supported by Mr. Tribu, moved approval of the application for 814 W. South as presented (garage behind the house) with the following conditions:

- 1. The frieze boards should be 1 x 8.**
- 2. The corner boards should be 1 x 4;**
- 3. The trim around the doors (3) should be 1 x 4;**
- 4. The siding should be 4" smooth fiber cement or Dutch Lap;**
- 5. The drip edge should be dark;**
- 6. The fascia and soffit should be wood. The soffit can be plywood with a continuous vent about 1" wide; trim to hold the plywood can be added at the building and at the fascia.**
- 7. If gutters are installed, they should be ½ round.**

Discussion followed with regard to the style of garage doors to be used. Mr. Osborne suggested using simple garage doors as shown in the picture or a carriage barn-type door. The doors may have windows at the top, but the owner has not expressed a preference at this point. Ms. Ferraro advised that she would work with Mr. Osborne regarding the details of the windows. She advised that the windows should be square rather than curved; there should be four windows, or the appearance of four windows, in each of the garage doors.

Ms. Seaverson expressed a preference for having the garage in the previous location.

The motion was amended to allow Ms. Ferraro to work out the details of the garage doors with the contractor and the applicants. With a roll call vote, the motion carried unanimously.

VIII. APPROVAL OF MINUTES (October 20, 2009)

Ms. DeYoung requested the following changes: Page 10, paragraph 2, line 5, and paragraph 5, line 1 should be Mr. Osborn. Ms. Seaverson requested the following changes: Page 1 at the bottom, Karen Leys was **not** present at the beginning of the meeting; that paragraph should be removed. Page 3, 2nd paragraph from the bottom, Ms. Seaverson was inquiring if the original siding was exposed where the chimney was removed, and the approximate age of the previous chimney (2nd line). Page 4, paragraph 3, add to the motion, "The joints are to be flashed and covered with trim."

Ms. Seaverson, supported by Ms. DeYoung, moved approval of the October 20, 2009 HDC minutes as amended. With a roll call vote, the motion was approved unanimously.

XIII. OTHER BUSINESS

A. Report from committee reviewing applications for open seat on HDC in January.

Mr. Bonsignore advised that the subcommittee is recommending Chris Roussi to fill the HDC seat to be vacated by Mr. Oudsema. Ms. Ferraro mentioned that there will be another vacant seat on the HDC in January 2011.

Ms. DeYoung, supported by Mr. Cinabro, moved to recommend to the City Commission that Chris Roussi be appointed to fill the seat on the Historic District Commission that will be vacated by Bob Oudsema due to term limits. With a roll call vote, the motion carried unanimously.

Ms. Ferraro advised that Ms. Seaverson and Mr. Bonsignore are eligible for another term. She will contact the City Clerk's office about the reappointments.

B. FYI Report

Ms. Ferraro advised that the reports were sent to the state with regard to having the 100 block of E. Michigan designated as a separate local historic district. The State Preservation Office advised that the 100 block should be an addition to the Haymarket local historic district, rather than an individual district. The building at 141 E. Michigan is to be included in the expanded district, but it is a non-contributing building. The owners of 141 E. Michigan are willing to be included in the historic district. The historic designation will have minimal impact for the non-contributing building.

Ms. Ferraro advised that she attended the appeal in Lansing regarding 609 Elm. Assistant City Attorney John Kneas; Frank Mumford from Sir Home Improvement; and the owners of the property were also present at the hearing. Ms. Ferraro estimated that there is a 1 in 4 chance that the HDC's decision might be over turned.

The De Novo hearing regarding 609 Elm took place in front of an administrative law judge, who will make a recommendation to the State Historic Preservation Review Board. The parties were allowed to introduce new evidence at the hearing. The judge will make a proposal for a decision, which is a written document containing the evidence presented. The State Historic Preservation Review Board will review the documentation and the judge's recommendation. The review board will make the final decision when they meet on January 15th, 2010. Ms. Ferraro may be present at that meeting.

The HPC has requested that the HDC members attend commissioner training in February or March of next year. The Michigan Historic Preservation Network offers training at its annual conference, which will be in Ann Arbor next year. The training will be on the first or second Saturday in May. The National Alliance for Preservation may also be

offering training in July. Another possibility is for the HDC to host their own training and maybe invite commissioners from the Holland, Battle Creek, Saugatuck or Grand Rapids HDC. Ms. DeYoung, Ms. Seaverson, and Mr. Cinabro expressed a preference for an evening training session rather than Saturday. The training will likely take place in City Commission Chambers at city hall on an evening other than Tuesday. Dinner will be provided. The HPC is willing to find an instructor to provide the training. Ms. Ferraro suggested contacting Kristine Kiddorf to provide the training, which may include information about how to handle issues regarding replacement windows.

Ms. Ferraro stated that a 45 minute video was produced in conjunction with the last window workshop. That video should be available in the next few months. Also available is a three-minute promotional video aimed at contractors to encourage them to add this training to their skill sets.

One of the Commissioners from the Holland HDC suggested a road trip to Holland for training, or the Holland HDC members could attend a training session in Kalamazoo.

Mr. Tribu requested an update regarding East Campus. Ms. Ferraro stated that she attended a tour of East Campus. There are problems with the roof leaking, less so in Vander Cook Hall than in North Hall. The task force has been meeting every month since April and they have some good ideas about what to do with the buildings on East Campus, and there is hope that progress will be made over the next couple of years. The university has not designated any funds for updates to those buildings. They are willing to have a long-term lease with a developer as long as the proposed use is compatible with the university.

East Campus is a National Register Historic District and if East Campus is added as a local historic district, they could receive the 40% enhanced tax credit. The university wants to have a new building to house their archives facility. Nothing has been ruled out regarding the East Campus buildings except demolition.

Ms. Seaverson requested an update regarding the 100 block of E. Michigan. Ms. Ferraro advised that the National Register Nomination will probably not be approved at the state level until May. There will be a public hearing for the new local historic district, and the final report will be submitted to the City Commission, but that will not happen until after the closing, which is scheduled for mid to late January. The public hearing in front of the City Commission will likely take place in February. Also, the ordinance will likely be updated at that time to include the proposed noticing procedures for the HDC, and the proposed updates to the demolition ordinance. The updates to the demolition ordinance will require notification of property owners within 300 yards of the property proposed for demolition. The notices will be sent two weeks prior to the meeting, and there will be costs associated with mailing the notices.

IX. ADJOURNMENT

Ms. DeYoung, supported by Mr. Cinabro, moved to adjourn the November 17, 2009 HDC meeting. With a voice vote, the motion carried unanimously.

The meeting adjourned at 6:12 p.m.

Submitted by: _____ Dated: _____
Recording Secretary

Reviewed by: _____ Dated: _____
Historic Preservation Coordinator

Approved by: _____ Dated: _____
HDC Chair