

KALAMAZOO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

CITY HALL - 241 W. South – Community Room – 2nd floor

Tuesday, May 10, 2016 – 6:00pm

*HPC meeting in November will be on
Wednesday November 9 to accommodate elections.*

- I. Call to Order – 7:00 pm**
- II. Approval of Absences:**
- III. Approval of Agenda:**
- IV. Introduction of Guests:**
- V. Citizen Comments on NON-agenda items* & Correspondence:**
- VI. Financial Report**
 - a. City (Dix) (report available at meeting)
- VII. Action and Discussion Items**
 - a. Work Plan Reports from Team Leaders
 - i. Sustainability (SU) – Stevens (Hidden Kalamazoo Tour)
 - ii. Preservation Month (PM) – Holewinski
 - iii. Iannelli Fountain (IF)
 1. Fundraising
 2. Planning
 3. Education – Brose
 - iv. Operations (O) – Wright
 - v. Sites (SI) – Aardema
 - vi. Designation (D) – Aardema
- VIII. Old/New Business**
 - a. Barnes & Noble – Authorize Pam O’Connor to communicate with Barnes & Noble and tell them we will NOT return the damaged books to them. The undamaged book will be returned to inventory and the other three for “give-away” under separate inventory. These books would be perfect to use as part of the Bronson Park Campaign Committee event in June.
 - b. Approve book gifts to Bronson Park 21st Century Honorary Committee at reception in June (**ITEM A**)
 - c. Bronson Park 21st Century Campaign Video (**ITEM B**)
- IX. Approval of meeting notes and minutes:**
 - a. March 29, 2016 – site visit to East Campus (**ITEM C**)
 - b. April 12, 2016 – regular meeting notes (**ITEM D**)
 - c. April 12, 2016 – National Register review - minutes (**ITEM E**)
- X. Correspondence**
- XI. Coordinators Reports on non-agenda items**
 - a. Coordinators monthly report (**ITEM F**)
- XII. Citizen Comments on NON-agenda items***
- XIII. Commissioner Comments**

Adjourn 9:00 PM

HPC meeting in November will be on Wednesday November 9 to accommodate elections.

The mission of the Kalamazoo Historic Preservation Commission is to educate the public and city leaders on the value of preserving the City’s historic resources, and to advise the City Commission accordingly. Questions and comments regarding this agenda should be directed to the Historic Preservation Coordinator at 337-8804. *The Commission’s Work Plan is on the reverse side.

* Citizen Comments are limited to four minutes on non-agenda items. During agenda items, citizens are also requested to limit their comments to four minutes unless invited to join in the discussion by the Commission.

KALAMAZOO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION GOALS FOR 2015-2016

PRESERVATION MONTH 2016 Leader: Vacant

GOAL: Present a diverse variety of events to celebrate Preservation Month in May and promote sustainability for the HPC

1. Committee to develop activities & budgets
2. Schedule & promote/publicize events
3. Preservation Awards committee to decide awards
4. Create work schedules, recruit & train volunteers
5. Complete events
6. Post event debrief presented to HPC
7. Form committee for next year

FOUNTAIN OF THE PIONEERS Leader: David Brose –

HIGHEST PRIORITY GOAL: Restoration & Public Education by 2017 -

Fundraising

1. ~~Secure full funding for Campaign management and implementation (2015)~~
2. ~~Develop broad and diverse participation on Campaign Planning Committee, (2015-16)~~
3. ~~Integrate Capital Campaign planning with Bronson Park Master Plan (2015)~~
4. ~~Restructure combined BPMP/FOTP funding goals/schedules with counsel and fiduciary (2016)~~
5. ~~Assemble Campaign Committee (2015-16)~~
6. ~~Secure *pro bono* contributions (design, printing, etc.) (2016)~~
7. Research and submit other private organization grant applications: 2014-2017.
8. Submit public agency grant applications: 2015-2017.
9. Implement tiered public fund raising (2016 - 2017)
10. Celebrate Fund-raising success and launch endowed interpretive programs — monitor work on Fountain complex (2017)

Public Education

- a) ~~Establish technical Sub-committee to develop and coordinate communication systems (2015)~~
- b) Develop and coordinate virtual and physical educational content with Gun Lake Band, KPS, KHPC (2015-16)
- c) Coordinate completed Reservation Marker design and structure with property managers (2016)
- d) Implement and evaluate NextExitHistory presentations (2015-16)
- e) Develop policies and procedures for ongoing and endowed public interpretation and programming in Bronson Park (2016)

NRHP Nomination

- a. Submit NATIONAL level NRHP nomination to SHPO (2015-16)

DESIGNATION Leader: Curt Aardema

GOAL: Enhance Local Historic Districts and National Register designated properties to add development potential and protect important resources.

1. Create a simple process for property owners interested in local or national designation.
2. Research new properties for potential designation.
3. Engage owners of 3 potential sites for local and/or national designation annually.
4. Identify funding sources to assist property owners or the HPC in preparing documentation.
5. Invite property owners to consider local or national designation based on research.

LOCAL DESIGNATION

Isaac Brown House, Woodside Properties, Park Club, South Rose/Cedar Area, Gibson Factory and smokestack, New Single Resource Properties?

NATIONAL REGISTER DESIGNATION

State Theater, Fifth Third, Bronson/Upjohn Headquarters, Kalamazoo Gazette Building, Neighborhood Expansion Opportunities, Update Bronson Park NR HD, Update East Campus NR HD, Gibson Factory and smokestack

SUSTAINABILITY Leader: Lynn Stevens

1. Interviewing and writing features promoting adaptive use and rehabilitation projects as examples of how preservation can be profitable. These could be used in seeking coverage from various media for this year's tour and on the website.
2. Expand outreach to people interested in Native American history to support the fountain education projects.
3. Provide support to oversight of the Lost & Found Book sales and O'Connor Fund for Historic Preservation.

OPERATIONS Leader: Chris Wright

1. Meeting quarterly or as needed with Laura Lam and Curt to discuss KHPC activities
2. With the changes in the way that's the Preservation Coordinators position is funded to try and keep up with what she will not be able to do anymore.
3. Ensuring quorum at meetings
4. Conduct O'Connor fund appeal in November
5. Help create monthly agendas with coordinator
6. Oversight and update of operational plans monthly
7. Ensure succession plan for HPC
8. Monitor funding of Preservation Coordinator and City budget (2015-2016)

SITES Leader: Curt Aardema **HISTORIC SCHOOLS INITIATIVE**

GOAL: Inform the Kalamazoo community about the history, value, sustainability and significance of preserving local buildings designed for education.

1. Compile information related to the schools on the list. Concentrate on the Lincoln School.
2. Establish a communication link with local school administrators.
3. Establish a program and presentation to share with school teachers, students, administrators, parents, etc.



May 10, 2016

Agenda item XIII (b)

Background:

The Bronson Park 21st Campaign is planning a reception for its Honorary Committee in June — to give the Campaign committee:

- a chance to get together as a group and meet each other,
- tell them more in-depth about the project,
- answer questions,
- thank them for lending their good name to the campaign, and
- turn them into ambassadors

As a means to thank them (several have already agreed to make gifts to the project, helped us make connections to other important people, invited us to speak about the project to community groups, and so on) we'd like to offer them a book. We have two choices. The first is a hard cover copy of Kalamazoo Lost & Found. The second is the Alfonso Iannelli biography.

We own thousands of hard cover copies of Kalamazoo Lost & Found, and since the soft cover editions outsell the hard, it makes sense to offer the hard cover copies.

We own 9 copies of the Iannelli biography, the remainder of those we bought to provide with grant applications and to sell. (Our sales idea turned out to be not so great.)

Action:

So, we would like to propose that the KHPC agree to:

- 1) give those Honorary members who would like one -- a hard-bound copy of Lost & Found, and,
- 2) give those Honorary members who would like one — a copy of the Iannelli biography.

If more than 9 copies of the Iannelli biography are needed, Peter Copeland, who sells them on-line, has offered to sell them to us for this purpose at his cost — \$ 25/each. So, if the majority of Honorary Committee members want an Iannelli book, it might cost the the KHPC \$400 — \$500 to cover the cost of the additional books — but that simply depends on the number of attendees and their preferences. (There are currently 24 committee members (several are husbands/wife teams.)

MOTION: TO APPROVE GIVING COPIES OF THE IANNELLI BIOGRAPHY AND/OR HARDCOVER COPIES OF KALAMAZOO: LOST AND FOUND TO PEOPLE WHO HAVE AGREED TO SERVE ON THE HONORARY COMMITTEE.



May 10, 2016

Agenda item XIII (c)

Proposal #2

Background

Also for the Bronson Park 21st Century Campaign. Everyone says in today's world, we need a 3-minute video for this campaign. Having looked on line and getting familiar with the many ways it can be used, we agree. Not just on the website we hope to have — but in public presentations to groups, as well as specific donors.

The Campaign's internal Working Group spoke with Dominick Gladstone earlier this month, who will do this for us for the paltry sum of \$3,000. (Probably less than half of what he'd normally charge.)

The Department of Parks & Recreation had agreed to pay for something else related to the campaign, but that's not going to happen now, so it said it could cover half the video cost, \$1,500, if we could find the other \$1,500.

Action

Can the KHPC match the Parks and Rec contribution to pay half the cost for a campaign video for Bronson Park?

MOTION: APPROVE UP TO \$1500 TO ASSIST IN PAYING FOR A PROMOTIONAL VIDEO FOR THE BRONSON PARK 21ST CENTURY CAPITAL CAMPAIGN.

Historic Preservation Commission
Tour of Western Michigan University – East Campus
March 29, 2016

Present:

- Gene Hopkins and Greg Jones, Hopkins-Burns Architecture
- David Dakin and Bob Miller, WMU
- Sharon Ferraro, Historic Preservation Coordinator and Wendee Mayes, recording secretary, City of Kalamazoo
- David Kohrman, Curt Aardema and Chris Wright (chair) Historic Preservation Commission

Heritage Hall (formerly East Hall) Tour Notes

- The fixtures throughout the building are replicas to the period that East Hall was originally built
- The railings in the lobby area are original to the building
- The original grand staircase was marble and has been replaced with new marble
- Original entry on the west side was restored
- Brick original to East Hall was left exposed in the hallway extension on the north and south side of the building (by the entrance and inside the bathrooms)
- Materials original to the building were reused throughout the current building
- On the garden level (in the office space, call center and mechanical rooms) the ceilings were left more exposed to the original building than on the other floors of the building
- Lobby on south side of the building has been made barrier free access with more original brick exposed
- Rosettes in the ballroom were repurposed from another building on east campus
- The columns on the west side were renovated
- The original lighting on the west side was retrofitted with LED fixtures
- The cupola with the graffiti was left in place.
- The two story fireplace from North Hall was transferred to Heritage Hall into the Xhang Financial Room

Comments during Heritage Hall tour

- Sash frames on windows of East Hall had always been lighter in the past; Heritage Hall sash frames and casings are very dark
- Sills were cast iron with limestone underneath

Discussion on North Hall

- The main question seemed to be why tear down all but the south wall and a small portion of the east and west wall
 - The idea was to create a performance venue; for small summer concerts and theatre on the south side of the wall

- On the north side, the idea is to build an amphitheater for larger performances with the wall being a backdrop
- There was a question as to why the windows were removed from the North Hall wall
 - The windows were removed as no longer having a purpose
 - Some thought went into putting bars into the windows, however there was concern about birds using them
- A final comment on the remains of North Hall was that it was left as an abstract piece

East Campus Zones

- Buildings included
 - Spindler Hall
 - Vandercook Hall
 - Walwood Union
 - Oakland Recital Hall
- These buildings show architecture from the 1930s through to the 1950s
- The back of the current medical center is the original State Hospital Nurses dormitory. (Not part of East Campus – this is on the south side of Oliver Street)
- Spindler Hall was updated in the late 1990s
- Football and baseball stadiums were designed by Osborne Engineering
 - Almost all of the original football stadium is still there although the only visible portions are the east and west ends of the north bleachers.
 - The original football stadium was encased in the new building when the addition was added in 1992
 - Oakland Gymnasium is still all original other than the roof structure which was reconfigured for the addition of the Seelye Center.

Miscellaneous Comments and Questions during tour of East Campus

- Was the stone wall that lines the sidewalk along the east side of Oakland Drive a part of the original campus
 - Ms. Ferraro answered that it was
- What part of the Olmstead original design was kept
 - Olmstead's selected this site for the original part of the campus with a building on the hill looking east
 - The original plan was never built
 - Site clearing was based on the original plan
 - It was then discovered that the original plan was unaffordable
 - The redesign used the original Olmstead plan as a guidance and took the principals and built off of that

KALAMAZOO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSIONCITY HALL - 241 W. South – Community Room – 2nd floor

Tuesday, April 12, 2016 – 6:00pm – MEETING NOTES

*HPC meeting in November will be on
Wednesday November 9 to accommodate elections.*

- I. **Call to Order – 7:00 pm**
- II. **Approval of Absences:**
- III. **Approval of Agenda:**
- IV. **Introduction of Guests:**
- V. **Citizen Comments on NON-agenda items* & Correspondence:**
- VI. **Financial Report**
 - a. City (Dix) (ITEM A summary, ITEM B – ledger pages)
- VII. **Action and Discussion Items**
 - a. Work Plan Reports from Team Leaders
 - i. Sustainability (SU) – Stevens (Hidden Kalamazoo Tour)
 - ii. Preservation Month (PM) – Holewinski
 - iii. Iannelli Fountain (IF)
 1. Fundraising
 2. Planning
 3. Education – Brose
 - iv. Operations (O) – Wright
 - v. Sites (SI) – Aardema
 - vi. Designation (D) – Aardema
- VIII. **Old/New Business**
 - a. Appoint a Study Committee to revise Chapter 16 for new historic resources, to identify new historic resources to be studied and changes and evaluation of the ordinance as needed – Sub quorum – Commissioner Wright, Aardema and Kohrman volunteered to work with Ms. Ferraro.
 - b. Give official Approval for the short documentary “1884” produced with help from the HPC to celebrate Kalamazoo’s 125th anniversary as a city, to be posted on the Kalamazoo Public Library Local History Room website - **Moved by Ms. Stevens, seconded by Mr. Wright, passed unanimously by acclamation.**
 - c. Confirm Historic Preservation Awards (ITEM C) Moved by Mr. Aardema, seconded by Ms. Stevens to approve the awards. Ms. Ferraro is to determine the state of publication of the Ladies Library book.
- IX. **Approval of meeting notes:** March 10, 2016 (**Meeting notes unavailable**)
- X. **Correspondence**
- XI. **Coordinators Reports on non-agenda items**
 - a. Coordinators monthly report (ITEM D)
 - b. 1st quarter Section 106 reviews (ITEM E)**6:55PM – short break**
- XII. **National Register Nominations – Certified Local Government Report**
SEPARATE MINUTES WERE TAKEN FOR THIS PART OF THE MEETING
 - a. Fountain of the Pioneers – Bronson Park (ITEM F)
 - i. Presentation of nomination by Sharon Ferraro (15 minutes), questions from the commission, comments from the public (limited to 4 minutes each)
 - ii. Deliberation and decision

- b. Western State Normal School Historic District (Additional Documentation) **(ITEM G)**
- c. Administration Building (Name Change/Additional Documentation for East Hall) **(ITEM H)**
 - i. Presentation of nominations by Gene Hopkins and Greg Jones of Hopkins/Burns (15 minutes each), questions from the commission, comments from the public (limited to 4 minutes each)
 - ii. Deliberation and decision

XIII. Citizen Comments on NON-agenda items*

XIV. Commissioner Comments

Adjourn

9:00 PM

City of Kalamazoo
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
Minutes
April 12, 2016

Third Floor Conference Room, City Hall

241 W. South Street, Kalamazoo, MI 49007

Members Present: Chris Wright, Chair; Curt Aardema, Vice Chair; David Brose; David Kohrman, David Benac; Lynn Stevens, Olga Bonfiglio

Members Absent: NONE

City Staff: Sharon Ferraro, Historic Preservation Coordinator; Carmela Hostiguin, Recording Secretary, Laura Lam, Director Community Planning and Development

Guests: Norman Jung; Pam O'Connor, Rodger Parzyck, Lynn Houghton, Peter Carroll, Sue Robinson, Hans Eugelke, Joshua Koenig
WMU: David Dakin, Bob Miller, Gene Hopkins and Greg Jones (Hopkins/Burns)

Ms. Ferraro: Announced introduction (see Intro Statement of Process and Responsibilities) -. Review the National Register Nomination for the Fountain of the Pioneers and additional documentation for the East Hall and East Campus National Register listings. Review of three documents specified: The Fountain of the Pioneers, Bronson Park National Register nomination, Western State Normal School historic district and additional documentation, and The Administration Building name change, boundary decrease and additional documentation for the original nomination in 1977 for East Hall.

First nomination: The Fountain of the Pioneers

Ms. Ferraro presented slide presentation (pictures). Ms. Ferraro then proceeded to ask Pam O'Connor, the author of the nomination to provide commentary per Ms. Ferraro forgot her notes. The nomination is for the complex including both pools, the fountain and sculpture and the network of paths inside the park.

Pam: Views were taken in the past fall by a very well-known local photographer. Pam talked about how there are sets of exits and multiple points of access in the park. She went over briefly over the east and west pool (where the children's sculptures are located). Both pools are surrounded by highly aggregated cast concrete coping; drinking fountains are located on the west and east end ... very modern in design. Water cannons have been inactive for several years now.

She reviewed the Pioneer and Native American sculptures. The fountain has deterioration that has occurred over time caused by ice and water over the winter months.

Ms. Ferraro mentioned there will be work done in the park, when the Master Plan has been finalized.

Ms. Ferraro asked the public if there were any questions for the fountain itself before deliberation.

Commission will decide if national register criteria are met by the conditions of the fountain.

Commissioner Chris Wright spoke and mentioned he has been involved with the historic commission for about 16 years. A 2.5 million dollar restoration of the entire park, including the fountain is in process.

Ms. Ferraro said part of the commission's responsibility is to answer two questions in this review process and make a determination. Question 1, does the certified local Government Commission, the Kalamazoo Historic Preservation Commission find that the property meets the national criteria of significance. In the national registry there are four criteria for significance A, B, C, and D.

A, is essentially a site building that is involved with a specific series of events or a pattern of events.

B, which we're not looking at, is associated with a specific person.

C, architectural setting more in style

D, archeological information

Ms. Ferraro asked does this fountain still represent from the period of its significance, which is defined as 1940. Does it still represent what it was at that time to the general public? And the second part of the question is does it meet the national register standards of integrity. Yes or no?

Ms. Ferraro asked if there were comments or questions from the commission.

Commissioner Curt Aardema asked if all the additions can essentially be removed at any given time. Ms. Ferraro replied with yes, she also mentioned that the holiday tree in the center of the park between the pools is dying and will be removed; this is also part of the master plan.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Sue Robinson from the public audience came up to speak, former Historical Teacher; she expressed that part of the reason why she moved to Kalamazoo is because there are five historical neighborhoods, and a full time Historical Preservation Coordinator with the City of Kalamazoo. Sue stated that the fountain is very important, especially coming from Montana ("Indian Country"). She expressed the importance of how the fountain was designed and built

from a student of a very important architecture, speaks for itself. Does it serve as a historical statement of its kind? Yes it does, and she doesn't think it's controversial. Pioneer standing west is a grand statement. Something we can't deny is part of history. Sue stated she strongly supports the preservation of the fountain.

Lynn Houghton first commended the work the commission has done as well as Pam in preparing the nomination. She mentioned that the book Kalamazoo: Lost and Found was published; part of the proceeds from the book was to see this through, to assist with the fountain. She stated she is very happy with where this project is going; she especially congratulated Pam.

Commissioner Curt Aardema asked if this nomination was considered under criteria A and C, he needed to clarify if A or C were the primary. Ms. Ferraro replied with C was presented first in the nomination; they felt that the work of a master was important here. It embodied very distinctive characteristics.

Speaker from the audience, **Frank Lucatelli** came up to speak, architect here in Kalamazoo. He stated that the architect artist Iannelli is a significant figure in American art, and while he was in one of Chicago Institute of Arts shows; they demonstrated his work and this fountain was mentioned in the exhibit. That alone is significant enough to keep the fountain. He mentioned that the fountain has concrete damage, a lot of deterioration. However; this damage is repairable with someone who understands what they're doing. He stated that this is something that needs to remain in Kalamazoo.

Commissioner David Benac stated he will make a motion to approve as presented.

Commissioner David Kohrman seconded motion. Commissioner Chris Wright asked if there were any further discussion. None was presented.

Roll call vote called by Ms. Ferraro, all seven commissioners said yes. Motion carries. Ms. Ferraro announced motion approval.

Ten minute break while Ms. Ferraro gets ready for East Campus and East Hall.

Presenter Gene Hopkins, Principal at Hopkins Burns came up to present, along with Greg Jones, also of Hopkins-Burns. Mr. Hopkins he gave overview of projects, changes and reasons for the updates to the national register nominations. Mr. Jones went over the details and specifics. He mentioned he has been involved since 1996. He mentioned Bob Miller and David Dakin from WMU were also present and any specific questions can be farmed out to them to answer. Mr. Hopkins stated the reasons behind the changes and updates were because of the due diligence the University has been doing. Evolution that is taking place Mr. Hopkins stated.

Commissioner Curt Aardema asked by looking at list, Ms. Ferraro provided, he sees 16 contributing resources including the landscape. He mentioned he saw 5 remaining, in his count there are unchanged or similar to what they were in 1952. Commissioner David Benac stated he,

also, had the same count. He wanted to make sure that count was accurate. Ms. Ferraro proceeded to clarify with a yes; they were taken off the list with 1990 nomination. The list includes all the buildings on the 1990 Western State Normal School Historic District listing. At that time two of the buildings were non-contributing because they were not yet 50 years old. The additional documentation cites the Oakland Theater and Spindler Hall as contributing – they were non-contributing on the original listing.)

Commissioner David Brose stated he was trying to reconcile with 15 that were existing. Ms. Ferraro replied with 15 existing plus landscape.

Commissioner Curt Aardema asked if the heating plant used to have a large smokestack. Ms. Ferraro replied yes and that was removed a long time ago, probably in the 1920's. Commissioner Aardema also clarified that the practice field on Davis Street field is not contributing. Mr. Jones confirmed with a yes.

Commissioner David Brose asked if the facade was visible. Mr. Jones replied with no.

Commissioner Curt Aardema asked if the opening of Waldo Stadium, from Stadium Drive side openings, in the same approximate locations of the opening that were on the original facade. Mr. Jones demonstrated that they are proportionally related to what was there before.

Commissioner Wright stated that during the tour, at any given time, if you were to going around the outside or inside of the structure of Waldo Stadium, if you could see any part of the original building. Mr. Jones replied that he remembers Commissioner Wright's questions and with the original facade, you cannot see it. The Bill Brown Center is built in front of the original north facade. He mentioned if you walk through the tunnel you can see the original masonry inside.

Ms. Ferraro demonstrated some photos for everyone to see what they were referring to.

Commissioner Curt Aardema mentioned there were about 5 buildings that were all built from 1938 to 1942; he asked if there was a reason why all were built, and if there were funds available. Mr. Jones said WPA funds were used for the stadium, he honestly doesn't know. His understanding was that the University had grown to a point that needed housing and they were housing related funds. It was the end of the depression and things were starting to recover. Funding was available. Commissioner Aardema clarified if the architectural firm that designed the stadium also designed all those buildings. Commissioner Aardema asked if same firm designed at any other college. Mr. Jones said they did some work at Michigan State and U of M.

Commissioner Brose mentioned that Michigan Union was also designed by same architectural firm.

Ms. Ferraro demonstrated more pictures of the Manual Arts Building and Waldo Stadium. Mr. Jones demonstrated how you could still see part of the original facade if you see it from a certain angle. Commissioner Aardema asked if it was the same tunnel under the north grandstand, Ms.

Ferraro replied with yes. Commissioner Brose stated that it appears that it has been covered over. Mr. Jones, again, said if you were seeing it from the east side looking west from Stadium, the tunnel is still visible. Ms. Ferraro proceeded in demonstrating a 2013 aerial map from City of Kalamazoo's GIS mapping site.

Commissioner Aardema asked if Oakland Drive was in its original configuration prior to the University. Ms. Ferraro replied with yes, Stadium Drive came in during the time the stadium was being done, before that it was Michigan Ave. and the train tracks further to the north. And yes Oakland Drive was in its original configuration.

Commissioner Aardema asked if the original windows in the buildings in the Historic District buildings were gone. Ms. Ferraro replied that most of them had been replaced.

Ms. Ferraro demonstrated more photos to the commission. Commissioner Aardema asked if the staircase on the Davis street hillside below East Hall was removed recently. Ms. Ferraro replied with yes it was removed with the recent renovation. Commissioner Aardema pointed the smoke stack on the old heating plant on one of the photos presented. Commissioner Wright asked when the oval side walk removed. Ms. Ferraro replied with 1940's she stated she really didn't know exactly.

Ms. Ferraro demonstrated a photo of the staircase that still remains.

Commissioner Aardema asked, referencing the East Hall, was it was designed in a way to continue that quadrangle concept, is that why there is a blank wall? Mr. Jones replied with yes, it was consistent with the original plan. Commissioner Aardema asked when West Hall was built. She replied with 1913.

Commissioner Olga Bonfiglio asked what the idea behind the remaining façade wall of North Hall was; she asked for an explanation of why this was done to that building. Mr. Hopkins replied that it was for intentions of future community functions to occur. Also, it would be used for orchestra performances or for small theatre. It will be able to be used as a proscenium for more of a natural amphitheater on the north side. The façade was left standing to celebrate rather than tearing it down.

Commissioner Aardema asked when the addition to the Training School building, when was that built. Ms. Ferraro clarified the year 1947. Ms. Ferraro demonstrated a picture of the bridge between East Hall and the training school. Commissioner Aardema asked why both buildings were not connected originally. Ms. Ferraro stated that the training building was a school for school, teachers were being trained and part of it was to separate it from the general student population.

Commissioner Brose stated that the training school was very important; it was used to train teachers and was at the very heart of the mission of the normal school.

Ms. Ferraro asked everyone if they were all in an understanding of what was being done. Updating the individual nomination for East Hall and changing the name to The Administration building. Current Official name is Heritage Hall. Ms. Ferraro also mentioned they are talking about the Western State Normal School Historic District commonly called East Campus.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Frank Lucatelli came up to speak, he mentioned he moved up to Kalamazoo in 1973. He is aware of the transitions that the Western Michigan University campus has gone through over the years. He stated he is disappointed on East Campus. In the years he has lived here, he stated that Western has become more invisible to the City. The closing of Michigan Avenue and other changes means the university has become a compound that is off limits for people who live in Kalamazoo. Mr. Lucatelli stated that the school was a gift so the school could get started, to bring the campus and the town together. Over the years it has separated. He would like to see that trend reversed. It would be worth to consider what can be done to bring them back together.

Ms. Ferraro made everyone aware that the questions to the commission are: does the building or the district maintain its integrity under criteria A and C. And if so, how.

Roger Parzyck came up to speak. He served on the commission for 20 years, very involved in East Hall and trying to save East Campus. He commended for a great job on the presentation. He stated that he considered the whole of east campus. The university seemed to consider that most of the other buildings, except East Hall had no significance at all. They were beautiful buildings. He stated they did not have to come down, the philosophy Western has, they let the building go and go the easy way out. Mr. Parzyck stated that it was a Parthenon if you looked up from the city. There was a 5,000 signature interest petition to keep the buildings, but that Western couldn't care less except about this incarnation from East Hall to Heritage Hall. He said he wrote to the state, there was so much loss to demolition, that the districts should be delisted. A meeting was scheduled, then cancelled. He then stated there were four cancellations so he thinks there was a political situation going. He said he wrote a letter to Brian Conway for justification as to why the delisting process was delayed and why Westerns application took precedence over a citizen's process. He doesn't understand why Western wants to keep it on the national register if they thinned out most of the historic buildings. There was so much loss that it should be delisted.

Commissioner Bonfiglio asked Ms. Ferraro to go back to the photo that demonstrated the red dotted line on East Campus and point out all the historic buildings that still remain there.

Commissioner Brose asked, what was the period of significance for the district as a whole? Ms. Ferraro replied from 1903 when founded, to 1952. Ms. Ferraro proceeded to show a map of everything that was there.

Ms. Ferraro asked if there were any one else for public comment.

Peter Carroll came up to speak. He stated that the local historic district should be delisted. There is enough loss of historic context and character within the district where there was green open spaces parking lots. He doesn't believe saving a facade is considered saving a building. He said you don't have to be an archeologist to find historic parts of stadiums. They should be evident to the eye for the public to see. Mr. Carroll believes all the demolitions of the building up on east campus were a travesty. The context of that campus has changed. He said it a clash of modernism and preserving what we could of what's left. The buildings there have been architecturally changed, all windows have been changed, materials are different, and openings are different. A lot of windows he mentioned. Architecture of the build has been severely altered. And it removed the historic component. Only one building has original windows. Preservation is all about maintenance and taking care of things and not just swapping things out. He thinks there is enough loss and it should not be considered historic district or historic building.

Norman Jung came up to speak. He served on commission for quite a while. He stated he's struck every time he drives Oakland by Disney-like buildings surrounded by black top and it reminds him of driving along the outer drive of Chicago looking at what was a historic landmark, Soldier Field. Something from outer space also referred to as the Tidy Bowl, the Soldier field. Mr. Jung said he would delist it.

Closing public comment.

Commissioner Bonfiglio asked if Western is requesting historic designation. Ms. Ferraro said they are already listed on the register and what they are doing is additional documentation of changes that have occurred since it was listed. She hesitates to call it a nomination, more like an amendment. The commission is charged with deciding, whether the changes they have documented have maintained the historical integrity and eligibly of criteria A and C, or not.

Commissioner Bonfiglio asked what the advantages were for Western if it were to be approved.

Mr. Hopkins said that Western, since 1996 has felt the original school from 1904-1952, they felt a legacy requirement to themselves to meet that criteria. Part of historic preservation is evolution. Relevancy and utility are important to maintain the significance. There is no advantage to Western.

Bob Miller came up to speak and respond to this question. He stated that unlike a private sector for-profit entity, the University is not in any position to take advantage of any tax consideration as a result of this designation since they are a tax exempt entity. Mr. Miller stated that they did not apply for this designation in 1990, but they are honored to have received it. They feel there is enough historical significance that remains not only in Heritage Hall but in the entire district. Western would like to retain that honor of having that designation. There is no ulterior motive beyond that. He mentioned that, as Mr. Hopkins pointed out; part of historical preservation is involvement into the future.

Commissioner Brose asked if that meant in order to evolve, do other buildings have to be let go. Mr. Miller replied with a paraphrase, President Dunn who made ultimately the decision. He said “We need to save something before there is nothing left to save”. The 25 million dollar investment that went in the renovation in East Hall to become Heritage Hall was where they felt they wanted to save the birth place of the university and quite frankly they were not in an economic state to save every building.

Commissioner Benac stated that looking through the buildings and changes, what it seemed to him that they were left with was the question of which buildings are left with integrity.

Commissioner Aardema stated there’s definitely a case to be made for a potential smaller district. He stated that there is definitely a compromise as a whole

Commissioner Benac reiterated that there is a difference when modifying certain aspects to a building. For example siding covering what was already there.

Commissioner Brose asked if a motion can be approved based on conditions, and conditions be size of the district. Ms. Ferraro replied and said that was not part of the motion formulated. It could be a recommendation added to the motion, but it has to be for what already exists.

Commissioner Aardema asked if they had the capability to recommend a change. Ms. Ferraro said that the commission needs to answer the questions asked in the Certified Local Government Report Form. Does the property still meet the national register for significance? And as it’s written in the additional documentation, does it still meet the national standards of integrity? Ms. Ferraro stated that there can be an additional motion stating we recommend the consideration for a smaller district that still has high integrity. That would be up to the commission. On the Certified Local Government Report Form those are the two questions that will need to be answered. An approval or denial of the materials as presented.

Commissioner Aardema asked how the other commissioner felt about suggesting a new nomination for a smaller historic district. This would be secondary to the primary question. Commissioner Brose answered that a smaller historic district meets the criteria for significance, no question about that as presented. However, the entire district has lost so much including Heritage Hall (The Administration Building). They were seriously compromised. Commissioner Brose mentioned he would support the idea of a smaller district including Oakland Recital Hall, Walwood Union, Spindler Hall and VanderCook Hall.

Commissioner Aardema said it’s a difficult position to be in because we have a nice group of buildings and they’re being asked to just throw out with all the other damage that is being done. He believes there is opportunity to carve out a new smaller district that could potentially be eligible, and maybe this can come out as a form of a recommendation. Ms. Ferraro replied with it would be a separate motion. Commissioner Benac asked if they can make that as a condition. Ms. Ferraro said no. Whether Western takes up the mantle to make a new nomination, we can highly recommend it but we can’t compel it.

Commissioner Kohrman said he likes the idea of a smaller district, but he is concerned and can't enforce it. Commissioner Benac asked if the commission were to deny and make a recommendation, that a newly created historic district might not be accepted. The commission today is deciding only upon the district that currently exists.

Commissioner Aardema asked if they were to deny recommendation of a tighter district, it would be in essence be recommending de-listing? Ms. Ferraro said not necessarily. The commission would be answering the question asked on the CLG Report Form. The commission would not necessarily be recommending delisting or requiring a new district.

Commissioner Benac said he would move to deny the district as it's presented and they make a strong recommendation to encourage the creation of a smaller district based on those four buildings.

Commissioner Lynn Stevens supported motion.

Commissioner Wright called the vote. Six commissioners voted to support the motion, commissioner Aardema abstained.

Motion carries.

Deliberation on East Hall is next.

Commissioner Brose asked if that existing National Register listing would still stand. Ms. Ferraro replied yes if they don't approve the added information, that listing will stand as is. It won't be an automatic de-listing because of the decision at tonight's meeting.

Ms. Ferraro said it's an amended listing, an update.

Commissioner Wright stated there were two contributing additions that were removed from the ends of East Hall. Ms. Ferraro clarified the original listing of 1978 included both the training school and the gym. Commissioner Wright mentioned the visible windows on the north and south side from the very first building before there were any additions. And now there are vents in the attic space instead of windows.

Commissioner Stevens asked Commissioner Wright about the evaluation involved. Ms. Ferraro replied saying integrity is both inside and outside. Commissioner Stevens said they have a two story fireplace in a one story room. She asked if this counts and Ms. Ferraro said yes and talked about detailed parts of each portion. The interior alterations and condition count to a certain degree, but there was also asbestos in the flooring that was removed and that is considered a hazardous material.

Ms. Ferraro said that, in her opinion, and she is aware that she is not a commissioner and cannot vote, much of the integrity is lost. The entire East Hall building as it existed, with the administration uses, classrooms and gym and, most importantly the training school articulated

the history of education and the Normal school. The buildings itself witnessed to the history of Western State Campus, and the evolution of the other buildings, created one at a time in in order to serve the purpose of the Normal school. That history of education at the normal school was represented in the succession of buildings. With the loss of the north wing with classrooms and gym and the Training School, the buildings that stood witnesses to that evolution and change are now gone. Ms. Ferraro said it's like the history skips ahead from 1905, when the first building was completed, to the late 30's and early 40's when the dorms and Walwood Union were built. With the loss of the two East Hall wings as well as the other three hilltop buildings, reduces the history of East Campus to the founding and the evolution of residence halls and athletic facilities without the College of Education.

Commissioner Aardema indicated the building is still there but the function of it has changed, and that speaks for itself. He said we know that time doesn't stand still and he thinks with what remains and what they've done represents the present and the question still remains. Two thirds of the building is gone. Commissioner Brose said two thirds of what was listed in 1978 is gone. Commissioner Aardema continued to say that, to him it's interesting because he doesn't think that they envisioned that the wings would be removed.

Ms. Ferraro stated that, again, referring back to the questions they have to answer. Does the current Administration building as defined by the additional documentation and changes that were submitted to the commission today, does it meet criteria A and C. She asked the commission to think of it this way; to think of East Hall as it was originally built with no additions. Does that building as we see it today, with the additions of the new stairs and the restrooms and west entrance; does it still maintain its historic integrity that meets to that time period? Time period was 1904-1909 to its original time.

Commissioner Stevens answered with no she does not think it does because of its modifications. She mentioned Heritage Hall is accessible and barrier free, which is important, it doesn't match the visual integrity of three years ago.

Commissioner Benac stated that he does not know of any building with this much modification, that would still be considered eligible. He moved to deny. Commissioner Wright seconded motion called the vote. Six commissioners voted to support the motion, commissioner Aardema abstained.

Motion carries.

Ms. Ferraro announced the motioned carried was to deny that the Administration Building meets the National Register criteria. Criteria A and criteria C are not meet. The Kalamazoo Historic Preservation Commission denies the additional documentation for the Administration Building.

No Commissioner comments.

Commissioner Aardema motioned to adjourn. Commissioner Wright seconded.

The meeting was adjourned at 9:30.

ADJOURNMENT

Commissioner Aardema motioned to adjourn. Commissioner Wright seconded. With a voice vote, the motion carried unanimously. The meeting was adjourned at 9:30.

The meeting adjourned at 9 p.m.

Submitted by: _____ Date: _____

Recording Secretary

Reviewed by: _____ Date: _____

Staff Liaison

Approved by: _____ Date: _____

HPC Chair

This page left blank for packets.

REVIEWS:

Historic District Commission:

✓ HDC cases to 04/05/16 – 6 total Fees total to date, 2016 \$196

2016 Reports - :

2016	2016	2015 (05/04)	2015 fees
○ 21 no fee	\$ 0	20 no fee	\$ 0
○ 7 bldg permit-3@\$34/4@\$35	\$ 242	5	\$ 170
○ <u>3 HDC hearing</u> - \$81*	<u>\$ 243</u>	<u>9</u>	<u>\$ 711</u>
31 TOTAL	\$ 487	34	\$ 881

* No HDC meeting in April/no change

Section 106 reviews (Federally funded projects)

2016

✓ Section 106 reviews to 05/03/16 – 2

✓ In 2015, 7 review were complete by 05/03/15

SITES and PROJECTS

- **Fire station at North & Douglas** – Work begins the week of May 9th and should be complete by June 30 2016.
- **J. Rhodes Building, North and Douglas – 1019-1025 West North** – the owners have lost the property to the county as a tax foreclosure. Demolition will probably be this summer – the demolition permit issued May 2, 2016.
- **Gibson Stack** – As of today, no work to deconstruct the stack has started. The owners have found a fiduciary agent to handle the funds. The boilers are on. No change
- **County Courthouse** – no updates
- **Nazareth Center (Nazareth Motherhouse)** no further news

VACANT – NOT REHABBED BUILDINGS AND/OR UPPER FLOORS**Downtown Kalamazoo****Historic buildings – 50+ years old****Underlined- in Historic District (Eligible for Federal HP tax credit)****Entire building vacant and undeveloped**

1. **KALAMAZOO GAZETTE BUILDING – 401 SOUTH BURDICK** – Purchased by Bronson Healthcare Group*
2. FINGERS FURS/BUSINESS REVIEW BUILDING – 423 SOUTH BURDICK
3. CHARTER ONE BANK – NORTH SIDE, EAST MICHIGAN 200 BLOCK (No HP tax credit eligibility – 10% eligible!)

Upper floors vacant or undeveloped – 4 on mall, 6 on Michigan Avenue

4. International Hotel – Fandango – 241-7 South Kalamazoo Mall (2nd & 3rd floors)
5. Montgomery Wards – Terrapin/Walgreens – 237 South Kalamazoo Mall* (2nd & 3rd floors) HK
6. Fuller Building – Petals & Postings/Invitations by Design – 233 South Kalamazoo Mall (2nd & 3rd floors) HK
7. Boudeman Building – Rustica - south end - 236 South Kalamazoo Mall, west side* (2nd & 3rd floors) HK
8. Stevens Building – 312 West Michigan – Studio Grille (2nd floor) HK
9. Clapham McDonald Building – 131 East Michigan – 3rd floor HK
10. Winstons (Weber Building) 228 East Michigan - 3rd floor HK
11. Hiemstra Optical (Chase Building) - 234-8 East Michigan*(2nd floor) HK
12. 266 East Michigan – Hall Building – Coney Island – upper three floors HK
13. 318 East Michigan – Hotel Holt – Alfred E. Bike – 2nd and 3rd floors (NEW OWNER) HK
14. 302 North Burdick – Kalamazoo Overall Co – Mr. Presidents – 2nd floor HK
15. 100 North Edwards – Nave Architects – 2nd floor
16. 150 North Edwards – Heritage Co – 2nd floor & far north, one story bay

Upper floor unoccupied

17. American National Bank (5/3) – 136 East Michigan – 15th floor only

First floor vacant, upper floors occupied

18. Metropolitan Center – one storefront – 105 East Michigan
19. Merrill-McCourtie Building – (south storefront only) Dragon Inn – 232 South Kalamazoo Mall

Notice this list is getting shorter!