

**City of Kalamazoo
TREE COMMITTEE
Minutes
July 7, 2020**

Zoom Webinar

Members

Present: Philip Dietrich, ECC Representative
Anthony Ladd, Asst. City Engineer/City Traffic Engineer, COK
Brian LaBelle, Forester, COK
Patrick McVerry, Deputy Director - Parks & Recreation, COK
Chris Patchell, Parks and Recreation Advisory Board (PRAB)
Steve Skalski, Asst City Engineer, Water Dept., COK
Brian Vogl, Forester, Consumers Energy

City Staff: Karen Rutherford, Recording Secretary

Guests: Sam Chansler, Consumers Energy

A. CALL TO ORDER

Committee Chair Anthony Ladd called the Zoom Webinar meeting to order at 2:00 p.m.

B. ROLL CALL

Committee Chair Anthony Ladd completed roll call and determined the aforementioned members were present.

C. INTRODUCTION OF GUESTS

Committee Chair Anthony Ladd introduced guest Samuel Chansler with Consumers Energy.

D. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

By unanimous consent the Committee adopted its meeting agenda as presented.

E. APPROVAL OF MINUTES (June 2, 2020)

Committee Member Patrick McVerry supported by Committee Member Chris Patchell moved approval of the June 2, 2020 Tree Committee Minutes. With a voice vote, the motion carried unanimously.

F. NEW BUSINESS

None.

G. OLD BUSINESS

Project Bronco – Consumers Energy - Tree Removals

Committee Chair Anthony Ladd opened discussion for Project Bronco. He stated Sam Chansler with Consumers Energy had submitted updated information regarding the additional trees that needed to be removed. Mr. Chansler stated he updated the spreadsheet indicating the trees that would be removed. He modified the diameter classes marking them up from the two inches class to four inches and higher. Additionally, he included the species mix which are cottonwood, soft maple, boxelder, and others. Mr. Chansler confirmed with Committee Chair Anthony Ladd that these were low value trees. The total count to be removed should be somewhere between 700 and 800 trees.

Committee Chair Anthony Ladd stated he inquired with the City attorney's office and has been informed the City has not received any type of permit request or easement request. Mr. Chansler stated his understanding was our legal team would get recommendation from the Tree Committee before moving forward with the easement and that Consumers Energy is looking for guidance from them. Committee Chair Anthony Ladd responded the Tree Committee's stance was to wait to see what was going to be settled out of the easement monetarily to compensate for what is being removed. He recommended a meeting be set up with all the parties involved to get these issues resolved. Mr. Chansler will get his real estate person involved with our legal team.

Committee Chair Anthony Ladd asked if Consumers Energy could reduce the number of trees to be removed. Mr. Chansler stated actually there is a chance it could go up in number. He stated once they get the area cleared then the trees in the adjacent danger tree zone will be more visible. There could be more trees in this area to be removed. If there is an increase, it would be a small amount, possible less than ten trees.

Committee Chair Anthony Ladd asked if they had an idea of the cost for replacement of the trees. Committee Member Brian Vogl responded the way to determine the cost would be to get an actual tree number count, species count, size count, and board foot count. Mr. Chansler added that Foresters, when they determine timber sales, will go out and estimate the volume and value of trees. A forester would determine the amount of cord and the amount of board foot volume. There are tables and measuring tools to establish this. You can look at the market to see what the trees are going for per species. A discussion followed. Committee Chair Anthony Ladd stated he can discuss this further with Mr. Chansler. Mr. Chansler stated he was hoping to start the work in the August to September timeframe.

Mr. Chansler stated they could table the decision for now and in the near future have another meeting with the City attorneys to get the process moving forward. Committee Chair Anthony Ladd asked Mr. Chansler to send him an email of the appropriate people who will need to be involved.

Committee Member Chris Patchell supported by Committee Member Phil Dietrich, made a motion to table a decision pending additional information. With a voice vote, the motion carried unanimously.

Bank Street Realignment

Committee Chair Anthony Ladd opened discussion regarding the mature sycamore tree at the Farmers Market on Bank St. He stated there was previously an approval by the Tree Committee to remove City trees for the City's Bank Street project. Three trees were identified to be removed. Additionally, there was a mature sycamore tree which the City was going to try to do some re-design work with the consultant to save the tree, possibly redesigning the parking lot. He stated he did some investigating and found the tree had been removed. He informed the Committee the crews that were out there working were under the impression that all the trees in that lot were to be removed. This was a miscommunication and not done purposely. He apologized to the Committee and stated they will work to correct this from happening again. Committee Chair Anthony Ladd proposed planting 3 - 2" (6-foot height) planting in the immediately area. He asked for input from the Committee. A discussion followed.

Committee Chair Anthony Ladd stated he doesn't think it would be a good idea to plant something until the realignment part of the project is done as to not endanger the newly planted trees. He stated this could be done in the late fall. They can shoot to plant in early November if the curbs and gutters are done. If not, they can plant in the Spring of next year. Committee Member Brian LaBelle stated he would investigate which trees would be the best replacement trees for the space available.

Committee Member Phil Dietrich supported by Committee Member Patrick McVerry, made a motion as a further condition of the Bank Street Alignment permit to remove trees, we are amending it to plant four, three-inch trees with the specific location and species to be determined. Options will be presented at the next meeting. Once this decision is made it will be a condition of the Bank Street re-alignment tree removal permit. With a voice vote, the motion carried unanimously.

Tom Huff, Peregrine Company, Donation

Committee Chair Anthony Ladd stated Mr. Huff was interested in donating to the committee for tree plantings in the downtown area. He stated they are in the process of working with the City's Economic Development Department to put together a set of standards for downtown plantings and Right-of-Way features. Currently there is a variety of planter boxes, tree species, open grates, etc. We are trying to put together some type of uniformity. The planning department has identified grant funds to hire a consultant who specializes in this type of work who will draft a plan. This is the reason for the delay in receiving the donation. We do not want to waste any money and we want it to be strategically invested. Committee Chair Anthony Ladd stated as these design standards are being developed, he plans to bring it to the Tree Committee, possibly via email, for their input.

GPS Location of Trees in Crane Park

Committee Chair Anthony Ladd asked Committee Member Patrick McVerry if he had any updates. He stated he has a list of the trees for the plaque names. They should be installed in August. The plaques will be in cement and placed at the base of the trees.

H. PUBLIC COMMENT

None.

I. COMMITTEE COMMENTS

1. Committee Member Chris Patchell noted the trees at Crosstown and Westnedge that were to upgrade the landscaping, are a big disappointment. The trees they planted on Westnedge are six Norway maples. It's unattractive and he thought they would have done a better job. He's suggested for future decisions made we need to emphasize that we want attractive plantings. They were placed on private property, so the Committee really doesn't have a say over it.

Committee Chair Anthony Ladd added this emphasizes the Committee's struggles with enforcement. Not only having a procedure for enforcement but enforcement itself. When we allow private plantings as reimbursement for public right-of-way removal, we lose control of what they choose to plant. These are things the Committee needs to think about when making decisions.

2. Committee Chair Anthony Ladd stated they are in the process of planning a tree planting project for this fall using FFE funds. We are preparing to send out post cards to neighborhoods that have a low number of tree canopy growth. When they did a rough assessment of the neighborhoods, they determined the Northside, Edison and Stuart had the lowest tree canopy growth. Residents of these neighborhoods will be getting a postcard with a link on how to map on the right-of-way where they would like to see a tree planted. Using this information along with our available plant space that we have logged into our asset software, we plan to put together a tree planting project. This may be a perpetual project in which we can request input from residents for future plantings. He anticipates this to be a huge success.

J. ADJOURNMENT

Chairman Anthony Ladd adjourned the meeting at 3:08 p.m.

Submitted by: *Karen Rutherford* Date: 9-14-2020
Recording Secretary

Approved by: *AOL* Date: 9/14/2020
Staff Liaison

Diameter class	Line Section 8AS	Line Section 8AR	Line Section 71H
	Marking Complete	Marking complete	Marking complete
4-10"	43	82	178
10-16"	40	70	78
16-20"	41	65	26
20-24"	23	34	11
24-30"	5	10	3
30"+	6	6	
Total	158	267	296

Trees were not tallied by species. An estimate of the species mix so far is 65% cottonwood, 10% soft maple, 10% boxelder, 15% other

Line Section 8AS Line Section 8AR Line Section 71H
 Marking incomplete Not marked, staked Marking complete

Diameter class

4-10"	35	178
10-12"	12	34
12-14"	4	26
14-16"	4	18
16-18"	16	15
18-20"	5	11
20-22"	5	6
22-24"	4	5
24-26"		1
26-28"	1	2
28-30"		
30-32"		
32-34"	2	
34-36"	1	
36-38"		
38-40"	2	
Total	91	296

Trees were not tallied by species. An estimate of the species mix so far is 65% cottonwood, 10% elm, 5% ash, 10% boxelder, 5% ailanthus, 5% hackberry. When the waters recede the remaining trees can be marked, mainly soft maple, ash, cottonwood, possibly some sycamore.