

**EMPLOYEES, RETIREES, AND BENEFICIARIES  
OF THE CITY OF KALAMAZOO, MICHIGAN  
EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM**

The Summary Annual Report of the City of Kalamazoo Employees' Retirement System for the year ended December 31, 2016 is presented for your information.

The information presented in this report is based on financial statements as audited by Abraham and Gaffney and the 2016 Actuarial Valuation prepared by Gabriel, Roeder, Smith & Company.

The City Charter requires that the City maintain an employees' retirement system. The City of Kalamazoo Employees' Retirement System was established as a "defined benefit" plan on July 1, 1942, by authority of Ordinance 188, as amended. As a defined benefit plan, the City must provide the benefits as defined in the plan, regardless of the cost. Therefore, the entire risk associated with providing the promised benefits rests with the City.

At year-end 1981, when the Investment Committee was created and applicable policies were implemented, the actuarial value of the assets was approximately \$26 million, the accrued liabilities were \$45.9 million and the funded ratio (actuarial assets divided by accrued liabilities) was 56%. The market value of the assets at year-end 2016 was \$604 million, the accrued liabilities were \$451 million, and the funded ratio was 134%.

Our investment managers continue to work diligently for retirement system participants in a recovering market and economy. The investment market improved over the prior year, with 2016 marking a 10.68% return, adjusted for inflation and net of fees.

The Investment Committee has remained dedicated to a strategy focused on long-term return. There have been no changes in fund managers this year. Merion Capital LLC continues to provide investment analysis, reporting services and additional investment information as needs arise for the Investment Committee.

The Retirement System continues to be managed very cost effectively. The total expenses for the plan were \$2.3 million or 0.389% for 2016. The Actuary assumes 0.50% for expenses. The average total cost for both private and public retirement systems is between 0.50% and 1.0%. Our low expense ratio is a substantial cost savings to the System.

Effective October 1, 2016, the City of Kalamazoo's existing transit operations spun off to become part of the Central County Transportation Authority (CCTA). The aggregate asset value of the trust as of December 31, 2016 was divided into separate amounts for the City Plan (\$604,411,432) and CCTA Plan (\$30,330,134) to reflect the spinoff of CCTA into its own stand alone pension plan. These values were determined by our actuaries; Gabriel, Roeder, Smith & Company.

Once again, this year's annual report has been combined with a pension guide for employees. This guide will help employees become familiar with the provisions of the plan.

The Employees' Retirement System is in sound financial condition and the fiduciaries remain committed to meet the obligations of the defined benefit plan in a prudent manner.

Respectfully submitted,

Thomas C. Skrobola  
Director of Management Services, Chief Financial Officer, Secretary to the Pension Board, and  
Pension Administrator

## **STRUCTURE**

The City Commission established a five member Board of Trustees of the Employee Retirement System to administer the system in accordance with the provisions set forth in the Code of Ordinances of the City of Kalamazoo. The Board of Trustees consists of a City Commissioner selected by the City Commission, the City Manager, a citizen who is appointed by the City Commission, a public safety member elected by the public safety members and a general member elected by the general members. The current board members and terms are as follows:

<b><u>BOARD MEMBER</u></b>	<b><u>TERM EXPIRES</u></b>
Dr. Randall Eberts (Citizen at Large).....	3/31/2018
Thomas Maher (Public Safety Member).....	3/31/2020
Robert Bauckham (General Member).....	3/31/2019
James Ritsema (City Manager) Chairman Pro Tem	
Shannon Sykes (City Commissioner)	

In addition to the Board of Trustees, the City Commission created the Investment Committee on October 19, 1981. The Investment Committee is charged with the management of the system's assets and has full authority to invest and reinvest such assets subject to the provisions of applicable state and local laws, ordinances and the investment policy. The Investment Committee is composed of as many as seven (7) members, all have an extensive financial background and none are participants in the system. The members are appointed by the Mayor with the consent of the City Commission and serve three (3) year terms. The current members of the Investment Committee are as follows:

<b><u>BOARD MEMBER</u></b>	<b><u>TERM EXPIRES</u></b>
Robert Salisbury, Chair .....	3/31/2020
Dr. Randall Eberts, Vice Chair....	3/31/2020
Daniel DeMent .....	3/31/2020
Janice Van Der Kley .....	3/31/2019
Dean Bergy.....	3/31/2019
Sandi Doctor.....	3/31/2019
Joel Wittenberg.....	3/31/2019

City Commission Liaison: David Anderson

Thomas Skrobola, Management Services Director and Chief Financial Officer, serves as Secretary to both the Pension Board and the Investment Committee.

## **INVESTMENT POLICY**

The financial objective of the Retirement System is to accumulate a pool of assets that will be sufficient to pay the benefits promised by the system, at the lowest possible cost, and to do so solely in the interest of the participants and beneficiaries. Within this objective, the system's assets are to be invested to achieve the maximum long term (3-4 market cycles) cumulative annual rate of return possible in relation to risk under the laws and regulations under which the assets can be invested. The Investment Committee has established an investment policy, which provides that the maximum amount permitted under the laws and regulations, will be targeted for investment in common stocks with the balance invested in bonds, short-term securities and real estate.

## **MONEY MANAGERS AND PHILOSOPHIES**

To mitigate volatility, the assets of the system are invested in various asset classes (common stocks, bonds, etc.) and in different investment styles within the classes. Managers are hired for their management style and strategy within these classes of assets. If a manager deviates from the style and strategy for which that firm was hired and the new style and strategy is in conflict with the investment policies, the manager is terminated.

The Employee Retirement System has five (5) investment managers who are responsible for the investment of the system's assets in accordance with the Investment Committee's policies. Two of the money managers are common stock managers, one is a bond manager and two are real estate managers.

### **Blackrock Global Investors**

Blackrock, New York, NY, has over \$5.4 trillion in assets under management. The System's assets are invested in BGI's equity index fund, which replicates the S&P 500 Stock Index.

### **Dimensional Fund Advisors**

Dimensional Fund Advisors, Austin, TX, has over \$518 billion in assets under management. DFA manages the System's Large Cap Value, Small Cap Value, Micro Cap, International Small Cap Value, and Emerging Markets Value portfolios.

### **Jennison Associates LLC**

Jennison Associates, New York, NY, manages over \$164 billion in assets and serves as the System's intermediate fixed income manager.

### **RREEF Real Estate**

RREEF Real Estate, Chicago, IL, has over \$53.6 billion in assets under management. The System's assets are invested in RREEF's flagship core fund, RREEF America REIT II.

### **The Vanguard Group, Inc.**

The Vanguard Group, Malvern, PA, has over \$4 trillion in assets under management. The System's assets are invested in Vanguard's Real Estate Investment Trust (REIT), which is one of the System's two real estate investment vehicles.

### **State Street Bank**

State Street Bank & Trust, Boston, MA, has over \$2.4 trillion in assets under administration and serves as the System's Custodian and Trustee. The balance of the System's assets is held in cash equivalents in order to meet monthly benefit payments and administrative expenses. State Street Bank safeguards the System's assets and serves as the control and monitoring point for the performance and procedures of our investment managers.

**CITY OF KALAMAZOO  
EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM  
PORTFOLIO PROFILE  
DECEMBER 31, 2016**

	<u>MARKET VALUE</u>	<u>PERCENT OF TOTAL</u>
BLACKROCK EQUITY INDEX	\$178,496,222	29.53%
DFA MICRO CAP	\$29,654,625	4.91%
DFA SMALL CAP VALUE	\$58,697,810	9.71%
DFA LARGE CAP VALUE	\$29,910,669	4.95%
DFA INT' SMALL CAP VALUE	\$59,760,280	9.89%
DFA EMERGING MARKETS	\$58,588,731	9.69%
<b>TOTAL EQUITIES</b>	<b>\$415,108,337</b>	<b>68.67%</b>
JENNISON INTERMEDIATE BOND	\$157,446,423	26.05%
<b>TOTAL FIXED INCOME</b>	<b>\$157,446,423</b>	<b>26.05%</b>
VANGUARD REIT INDEX	\$15,143,760	2.51%
RREEF REAL ESTATE	\$16,545,364	2.74%
<b>TOTAL REAL ESTATE</b>	<b>\$31,689,124</b>	<b>5.24%</b>
SHORT-TERM INVESTMENTS	\$234,734	0.04%
<b>TOTAL FUND</b>	<b><u>\$604,478,619</u></b>	<b><u>100.0%</u></b>

Accounting for payables of \$67,187, net assets available for plan benefits are \$604,411,432.

Portfolio reflects only City of Kalamazoo Pension Plan assets.

Michigan Public Act 485 limits the percentage of system assets invested in equity securities to 70% of the total portfolio.

**SUMMARY OF PLAN ASSETS  
MARKET VALUE BASIS  
December 31, 2016**

<b>NET ASSETS AT BEGINNING OF PERIOD</b>	<b>\$589,527,061</b>
<b>ADDITIONS:</b>	
Employer Contributions	\$0
Employee Contributions	\$1,085,940
Investment Gain(Loss)	\$74,963,490
<b>TOTAL ADDITIONS</b>	<b>\$76,049,430</b>
<b>DEDUCTIONS:</b>	
Benefit Payments	\$28,474,218
Participant Withdrawals	\$22,652
Administrative Expenses	\$328,746
Investment Manager Fees	\$2,023,500
CCTA Pension spinoff	\$30,315,942
<b>TOTAL DEDUCTIONS</b>	<b>\$61,165,059</b>
<b>NET ASSETS AT END OF PERIOD</b>	<b><u>\$604,411,432</u></b>
<b>INCREASE/(DECREASE)</b>	<b>\$14,884,371</b>

The increase/(decrease) includes unrealized appreciation of the value of the system assets; that is, the difference between the market value of the system's assets at the end of the year and the market value of the system's assets at the beginning of the year, and the cost of assets acquired during the year. The net change of assets in 2016 reflects the \$30.3M CCTA Pension spinoff.

## INVESTMENT PERFORMANCE

The investment objective is to achieve a "real" rate of return (nominal rate less inflation) of 5% over time. This objective has been achieved since the inception of the current organization in 1982.

	<u>Annualized Rates of Return</u> <u>For Periods Ending December 31</u>		
	<u>2016</u> <u>1 year</u>	<u>2012-2016</u> <u>5 years</u>	<u>Since</u> <u>1982</u>
Nominal Rate of Return	12.75%	10.40%	11.04%
Inflation	2.07%	1.36%	2.70%
<b>Real Rate of Return</b>	<b>10.68%</b>	<b>9.04%</b>	<b>8.34%</b>

## SYSTEM EXPENSES

The Investment Committee is committed to the cost effective management of the system. All fees and expenses are reviewed and approved in open Committee meetings.

It is customary to measure expenses as a percent (%) of assets under management in terms of Basis Points (BP). One hundred basis points are equal to 1%. One basis point (1 BP) is equal to one-hundredth of a percent (0.01%) of assets under management.

The 2016 expenses were as follows:

	<u>EXPENSE</u>	<u>% OF MARKET ASSETS</u>
Investment management fees	\$1,810,110	29.9 BP or .299%
Trust and custodial fees	\$213,390	3.5 BP or .035%
Administrative fees paid to the City	\$153,024	2.5 BP or .025%
Other: (Audit, Actuary, Due Diligence, etc.)	\$175,722	2.9 BP or .029%
	<b><u>\$2,352,246</u></b>	<b><u>38.9 BP or .389%</u></b>

## **ACTUARIAL FUNDING OF BENEFITS**

The System's membership totaled 1,481 as of December 31, 2016. Retirees and beneficiaries comprised 906 of this total, and during 2016 they received \$28,474,218 distributed in the form of benefit payments. Not all participants of the system have yet earned the right to receive benefits; 53 individuals are entitled to deferred benefits and 522 active members are currently contributing to the System. Membership totals include only City of Kalamazoo participants, reflecting the spinoff of CCTA members.

Employer contributions, if applicable, are made in accordance with the funding rates recommended by Gabriel, Roeder, Smith & Company, in the annual Actuarial Valuation Report. The 2016 valuation report is again recommending \$0 contributions. Employee contributions are made in accordance with union contracts or, in the case of non-bargained employees, in accordance with provisions within the code of ordinances.

The market value of assets is not used for funding level calculation purposes. Instead, each year's investment gains or losses are spread equally over the following five (5) years by the actuary. This reduces annual fluctuations in asset value and contribution rates caused by changes in market conditions. By policy, any annual gain or loss will be recognized over five years, however, the actuarial assets may not be less than 80% of the market value of assets.

In order to provide a clean starting point for the separation of City and CCTA asset values, the Actuarial Value of Assets was reset to the Market Value. This was accomplished by fully recognizing historical deferred asset gains/(losses), which resulted in a 0.9% increase in total valuation assets as of December 31, 2016. The 2017 valuation will resume the smoothing method of spreading gains/(losses) separately for City and CCTA assets.

The market value of assets available for plan benefits at the end of 2016 was \$604,411,432. There is \$1.34 of market value assets for each \$1.00 of liabilities.

### **ACTUARIAL FUNDING (\$ 000)**

<b>YEAR ENDED</b>	<b>ACTUARIAL ASSETS</b>	<b>ACTUARIAL LIABILITIES</b>	<b>ASSETS AS % OF LIABILITIES</b>
1970	\$6,782	\$10,921	62.1%
1980	\$28,151	\$42,848	65.7%
1990	\$99,014	\$100,981	98.1%
2000	\$331,443	\$208,070	159.3%
2010	\$518,339	\$367,423	141.1%
2016	\$604,411	\$450,931	134.0%

Beginning in 2016 assets and liabilities reflect only the City of Kalamazoo Pension Plan.

## **HOW TO OBTAIN ADDITIONAL INFORMATION**

You have the right to examine the text of the Retirement Ordinance, Actuarial Valuation and the Audited Financial Report. These are available during regular business hours in the Management Services Division of City Hall or at the City of Kalamazoo website [www.kalamazoocity.org](http://www.kalamazoocity.org).

If you have questions or need information regarding the Retirement System, please contact:

Thomas C. Skrobola, @ 269-337-8468 or  
[skrobolat@kalamazoocity.org](mailto:skrobolat@kalamazoocity.org)